



## Ancient human microbiomes



Christina Warinner<sup>a</sup>, Camilla Speller<sup>b</sup>, Matthew J. Collins<sup>b</sup>, Cecil M. Lewis Jr.<sup>a,\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Anthropology, University of Oklahoma, 101 David L. Boren Blvd., Norman, OK 73019, USA

<sup>b</sup> Department of Archaeology, University of York, Wentworth Way, York, YO10 5DD, UK

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article history:

Received 4 March 2014

Accepted 29 October 2014

Available online 3 January 2015

#### Keywords:

Ancient DNA  
Metagenomics  
Metaproteomics  
Coprolite  
Feces  
Dental calculus

### ABSTRACT

Very recently, we discovered a vast new microbial self: the human microbiome. Our native microbiota interface with our biology and culture to influence our health, behavior, and quality of life, and yet we know very little about their origin, evolution, or ecology. With the advent of industrialization, globalization, and modern sanitation, it is intuitive that we have changed our relationship with microbes, but we have little information about the ancestral state of our microbiome, and we therefore lack a foundation for characterizing this change. High-throughput sequencing has opened up new opportunities in the field of paleomicrobiology, allowing us to investigate the evolution of the complex microbial ecologies that inhabit our bodies. By focusing on recent coprolite and dental calculus research, we explore how emerging research on ancient human microbiomes is changing the way we think about ancient disease and how archaeological studies can contribute to a medical understanding of health and nutrition today.

© 2014 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

### Introduction

Genetic sequencing has revolutionized our understanding of the tree of life and humans' place within it. The development of the Sanger method of DNA sequencing in 1977 and the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) method of DNA amplification in 1983 ushered in an explosion of genetic data that determined the phylogeny of humans and the great apes (Ruvolo, 1997), rejected the biological concept of race in humans (Long and Kittles, 2003), and reconstructed the peopling of the world (Oppenheimer, 2012). The arrival of next generation sequencing (NGS) in the late 1990s facilitated the sequencing of the first complete human genome (Venter et al., 2001), and the subsequent commercial release of this technology in the mid-2000s enabled the genome sequencing of archaic humans, including Neanderthals (Green et al., 2010; Prüfer et al., 2014), Denisovans (Krause et al., 2010; Reich et al., 2010; Meyer et al., 2012), and the mitochondrial genome of an archaic hominin classified as *Homo heidelbergensis* (Meyer et al., 2014), resulting in discoveries that have further reorganized and refined the human family tree. These studies have addressed fundamentally important aspects of human evolution. Nevertheless, the human genome encompasses only a fraction of the total genetic diversity found

within humans. The collective microbial communities inhabiting the human body, known as the human microbiome, contain a vast amount of genetic and functional diversity far exceeding that of our own nuclear and mitochondrial genomes (Qin et al., 2010). A growing appreciation of the role of microbiomes in host essential life functions, the etiology of disease, and even speciation (Human Microbiome Project Consortium, 2012; Blaser et al., 2013; Brucker and Bordenstein, 2013; McFall-Ngai et al., 2013) challenges conventional views of the biological species concept (Mayr, 1963; Brucker and Bordenstein, 2013) and raises the question of whether or not ancient human microbiomes should also be investigated in order to explore broader issues in human evolution. This paper will discuss the relationship between humans and their microbiomes and review new developments in the emerging field of ancient microbiome research. We argue that only by also exploring our microbiomes both today and in the past can we fully understand what it means to be human.

### The human microbiome

Collectively, the microorganisms of the human body include an astounding number of bacteria. Since the late 1970s, it has been known that the number of bacterial cells ( $\sim 10^{14}$ ) in and on the human body exceeds the number of human cells ( $\sim 10^{13}$ ) by at least an order of magnitude (Savage, 1977; Peterson et al., 2009; Bianconi et al., 2013). In 2010, it was established that the estimated number

\* Corresponding author.

E-mail address: [cmlewis@ou.edu](mailto:cmlewis@ou.edu) (C.M. Lewis).

of unique bacterial genes in our 'accessory genome' (~3,300,000) exceeds the number of our own genes (~22,000) by a factor of 150 (Qin et al., 2010). Despite being 1,000 times smaller than human cells, bacteria still make up about 2% of adult body mass (1.5 kg), making them collectively equivalent in size to the human brain (1.4 kg) or liver (1.6 kg; Molina and DiMaio, 2012), leading some to refer to our resident microbes as an additional human organ (O'Hara and Shanahan, 2006; Baquero and Nombela, 2012). Alternatively, the human–microbial relationship has also been compared to that of a superorganism (Scher and Abramson, 2011), like a colony of bees, or that of a holobiont (Singh et al., 2013), like a coral reef.

In recognition of the need for a collective term to refer to the large number of underexplored and mostly nameless microorganisms inhabiting the human body, Joshua Lederberg coined the term *microbiome* in 2001 to "signify the ecological community of commensal, symbiotic, and pathogenic microorganisms that literally share our body space and have been all but ignored as determinants of health and disease" (Lederberg and McCray, 2001:8; see also Scher and Abramson, 2011). The term *microbiome* has also come to be used more restrictively, referring to the collective molecular (especially genomic) data obtained from a community of microorganisms, rather than to the microorganisms themselves (e.g., Hooper and Gordon, 2001), resulting in some confusion in the literature. For the purposes of this review, we will use the term *microbiome* in accordance with its original published definition by Lederberg as an ecological community of microorganisms, and we will use the term *microbiota* as a synonym. To refer to the collective genomes of the host and its microbiome, we will use the term *hologenome* (Zilber-Rosenberg and Rosenberg, 2008). Finally, we will use the terms *metagenome* and *metaproteome* to refer to the collective genomic and proteomic information obtained from an environmental sample. These terms have developed in parallel with major technological advances in microbiology and molecular methods for investigating complex microbial systems.

#### *Recent technical advances in microbiome research*

Early investigations of human-associated microbes focused on isolating and culturing individual bacterial species and strains. Using these methods, hundreds of human microbiome species have been identified and named (e.g., Dewhirst et al., 2010). However, culture-free molecular analyses of prokaryotic 16S ribosomal RNA (rRNA) and the 16S rRNA gene using methods first developed by Carl Woese (Woese and Fox, 1977) and Norman Pace (Pace, 1997) indicate that at least 60–80% of bacteria inhabiting the human body cannot be cultured in a laboratory (Suau et al., 1999; Hayashi et al., 2002). To access these unculturable members, new molecular methodologies were developed, including terminal restriction fragment length polymorphism (T-RFLP) molecular fingerprinting, single target PCR, multiplex PCR, quantitative PCR (qPCR), fluorescent in situ hybridization (FISH), checkerboard hybridization, and 16S rRNA-based microarrays, among others (Paster and Dewhirst, 2009; Han et al., 2012). The most powerful of these methods combined PCR amplification of 16S rRNA genes from a mixed microbial sample using universal bacterial primers, followed by cloning of PCR products into a plasmid vector, transformation of the plasmids into competent *Escherichia coli* cells, plating and colony picking, plasmid purification, and Sanger sequencing of up to several thousand clones. These sequences could then be clustered by similarity (usually 97.0% or 98.5% sequence similarity) into distinct phylogenies correlating approximately to bacterial species. In 2010, this approach was successfully used to determine 600 prevalent members of the human oral microbiome (Dewhirst et al., 2010); however, characterizing rare or less prevalent oral taxa using

this method is not feasible given the high-cost, labor-intensive, and low throughput nature of the cloning and sequencing steps.

The advent of NGS has transformed microbiome investigations by eliminating the need for cloning and allowing the acquisition of millions of 16S rRNA gene sequences at a fraction of the cost per base compared with conventional techniques. Despite shorter read lengths and a shift of focus to individual 16S rRNA gene hypervariable regions rather than the entire gene, the increased sequencing depth has revealed a great diversity of low abundance taxa within the human microbiome, expanding the known taxonomic complexity of the oral microbiome alone by more than an order of magnitude (Keijsers et al., 2008; Paster and Dewhirst, 2009). Next generation sequencing has also made possible microbiome metagenomics, the collective study of all genes and genomes within a microbiome. This has enabled microbiome research to move beyond taxonomic questions of 'who's there' to functional questions of 'what they do' (HMP, 2012). Moreover, single cell genome amplification and bioinformatics improvements in sequence assembly from metagenomic datasets are allowing full genome reconstructions of unculturable taxa, providing our first glimpse at the potential function of these enigmatic species (Marcy et al., 2007; Liu et al., 2012). With respect to ancient microbiomes, NGS offers two additional advantages over previous methods. First, being a culture-free method, the analysis can be applied to dead cells, and second, NGS is optimized for fragmented DNA within the size range typical of ancient DNA (<300 bp).

Advances in metagenomic technologies are also being matched in the field of metaproteomics. Previously, the detection of microbial proteins primarily relied on antibody-based approaches, often linked to gel electrophoresis (e.g., Western Blotting). Proteomics-based methods advanced with the use of comparative 2D (pI versus MW) gels with specific spots eluted and analyzed by soft ionization tandem mass spectroscopy (MS/MS). These 'top-down' approaches are increasingly being replaced by 'bottom-up' approaches also known as shotgun proteomics, which conduct mass spectrometric analyses of peptides from enzymatic digestion of the total protein extract. Such bottom-up approaches allow for higher throughput and are additionally more conducive to ancient protein research, as they do not require intact protein molecules.

These advanced molecular methods are providing unprecedented insights into the function and dysfunction of human microbial systems, giving a path to understanding the role of microbiomes in human health and disease.

#### *Human microbiome function and dysfunction*

Since the early 2000s, numerous studies have investigated the structure and function of the human microbiome using a variety of molecular methodologies. A notable boost to these efforts began in 2008 after the initiation of the National Institutes of Health Human Microbiome Project (HMP) in the United States and the Metagenomics of the Human Intestinal Tract (MetaHIT) project in Europe. Whereas human-associated microorganisms were previously viewed at best as passive commensal tag-alongs or nuisances to be scrubbed or flossed away, we now recognize that the human oral, gut, skin, and urogenital microbiota play critical roles in maintaining host health by performing essential functions in digestion and metabolism (Lozupone et al., 2012; Tremaroli and Backhed, 2012; Yatsunenko et al., 2012), vitamin production (LeBlanc et al., 2013), and immune system education and maintenance (Lee and Mazmanian, 2010; Hooper et al., 2012), as well as by restricting the colonization, growth, reproduction, and virulence expression of exogenous bacterial pathogens through resource competition (Brotman, 2011; Lozupone et al., 2012; Fitz-Gibbon et al., 2013). However, when challenged by poor diet, illness,

stress, antimicrobial drugs, and other environmental disruptions, the ecology of the human microbiome can transition from a mutualistic to a dysbiotic state, contributing to local and systemic illnesses as varied as obesity, type II diabetes, irritable bowel disease, and colon cancer (Rose et al., 2007; Clemente et al., 2012; Devaraj et al., 2013), periodontal disease and dental decay (Marsh, 2003; Pihlstrom et al., 2005; Kumar et al., 2006; Aas et al., 2008), atherosclerosis and endocarditis (Scannapieco et al., 2003; Koren et al., 2011; Koeth et al., 2013), autism, anxiety, and depression (El-Ansary et al., 2013; Foster and Neufeld, 2013).

The healthy human microbiome also plays host to a number of endemic, but potentially acute, opportunistic pathogens, such as *Streptococcus pneumoniae*, *Haemophilus influenzae*, *Neisseria meningitidis*, *Clostridium difficile*, *Propionibacterium acnes*, and *Staphylococcus aureus* (HMP, 2012), some of which are implicated in hospital and community-acquired infections and pose particular risk for the elderly and immunocompromised (Shay, 2002). Alarming, multiple antibiotic resistant strains are increasingly being detected in the normal oral and gastrointestinal microbiota of healthy individuals (Ready et al., 2003; Carlet, 2012). This suggests that the use of antibiotic therapy, either through direct clinical application or through indirect growth stimulating or prophylactic application in livestock, impacts non-clinical targets and can result in long-term endogenous reservoirs of antibiotic resistance (Roberts and Mullany, 2010). Additionally, antibacterial therapies can themselves be disruptive to healthy bacterial communities, leading to further complications. Therapeutic courses of broad-spectrum antibiotics, for example, are known to disrupt gut and urogenital microbiota (Jakobsson et al., 2010; Jernberg et al., 2010), where they may induce antibiotic-associated colitis and bacterial vaginosis, respectively (Willing et al., 2011). As a consequence, there is growing interest in probiotic and prebiotic therapies for treating disrupted microbiomes, but lack of basic knowledge on what constitutes a healthy microbiome, as well as a clearer understanding of the transmission and formation of healthy microbiota, are limiting factors in the development of these therapies (Marsh, 2003; Wade, 2010; Zarco et al., 2012).

#### Need for paleomicrobiology data

Although considerable effort has been invested in characterizing healthy gut and oral microbiomes, recent investigations of rural, non-Western populations (Lozupone et al., 2012; Yatsunenko et al., 2012) have raised questions about whether the microbiota we currently define as normal have been shaped by recent influences of modern Western diet, hygiene, antibiotic exposure, and lifestyle (Maslowski and Mackay, 2011). The process of industrialization has dramatically reduced our direct interaction with natural environments and fundamentally altered our relationship with food and food production. Situated at the entry point of our food, and the locus of food digestion, the human oral and gut microbiomes have evolved under conditions of regular exposure to a diverse range of environmental and zoonotic microbes that are no longer present in today's globalized food chain. Additionally, the foods themselves have changed from the wild natural products consumed by our hunter-gatherer ancestors to today's urban supermarkets stocked with an abundance of highly processed Western foodstuffs containing artificially enriched levels of sugar, oil, and salt, not to mention antimicrobial preservatives, petroleum-based colorants, and numerous other artificial ingredients. This dietary shift has altered selection pressure on our microbiomes. For example, under the 'ecological plaque hypothesis,' diseases such as dental caries and periodontal disease are described as oral ecological catastrophes of cultural and lifestyle choices (Marsh, 2003).

Although it is now clear that the human microbiome plays a critical role in making us human, in keeping us healthy, and in making us sick, we know remarkably little about the diversity, variation, and evolution of the human microbiome both today and in the past. Instead, we are left with many questions: When and how did our bacterial communities become distinctly human? And what does this mean for our microbiomes today and in the future? How do we acquire and transmit microbiomes and to what degree is this affected by our cultural practices and built environments? How have modern Western diets, hygiene practices, and antibiotic exposure impacted 'normal' microbiome function? Are we still in mutualistic symbiosis with our microbiomes, or are the so-called 'diseases of civilization'—heart disease, obesity, type II diabetes, asthma, allergies, osteoporosis—evidence that our microbiomes are out of ecological balance and teetering on dysbiosis (Stecher et al., 2013)? At an even more fundamental level, who are the members of the human microbiome, how did they come to inhabit us, and how long have they been there? Who is 'our microbial self' (Gonzalez et al., 2011)?

Studies of remote and indigenous communities (Contreras et al., 2010; Yatsunenko et al., 2012; Schnorr et al., 2014) and crowdsourcing projects such as the American Gut ([www.americangut.org](http://www.americangut.org)), the Earth Microbiome Project ([www.earthmicrobiome.org](http://www.earthmicrobiome.org)), and uBiome ([www.uBiome.com](http://www.uBiome.com)) are attempting to characterize modern microbiomes across a range of contemporary environments. Nevertheless, even the most extensive sampling of modern microbiota will provide limited insight into Pre-Industrial microbiomes. By contrast, the direct investigation of ancient microbiomes from discrete locations and time points in the past would provide a unique view into the coevolution of microbes and hosts, host microbial ecology, and changing human health states through time.

#### Ancient microbiome research

Upon death, the ecology of the human microbiome transforms dramatically through the process of soft tissue decomposition (Morris et al., 2006). With the exception of frozen and mummified remains, only two microbiomes routinely produce substrates that, under favorable conditions, persist after death in archaeological contexts: fecal material of the gut microbiome may desiccate or mineralize to produce coprolites, and dental plaque of the oral microbiome calcifies in situ during life such that by the time of death it is already in a semi-fossilized state known as dental calculus that resists decomposition and thus continues to preserve after death. The opportunity to investigate ancient microbiomes directly through coprolites and dental calculus allows us to redefine questions of past human health within a much broader framework that includes not only the investigation of epidemic obligate pathogens but also the carriage rates and risks posed by endemic and dormant pathogens, as well as the health and resiliency of the overall microbial community. Finally, in the case of dental calculus, which forms incrementally without remodeling, it may even be possible to reconstruct a life history of disease, including survivorship of past pandemics.

#### Coprolites

Coprolites are mineralized or desiccated feces. Coprolites have been found dating as far back as 270 Ma (millions of years ago) during the Paleozoic Era (Dentzien-Dias et al., 2013), and many famous examples of dinosaur coprolites are known from the Cretaceous period ca. 145–66 Ma (Chin et al., 1998). Perhaps less well known are the human coprolites and latrine deposits that have been found at archaeological sites dating from the Late Paleolithic

onwards (after ca. 22,000 BP [years before present]; [Wendorf et al., 1988](#); [Jenkins et al., 2012](#)). Unlike paleontological coprolites, archaeological coprolites were not initially recognized as an important biological data source and were only irregularly curated throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Even now that their potential is recognized, coprolites and preserved intestinal contents remain rare finds, and they tend to preserve intact only under extremely dry or frozen conditions (e.g., [Cano et al., 2000](#); [Tito et al., 2008](#)). Additionally, because human coprolites are not fully fossilized and may be fragmentary or amorphous, they are often difficult to identify or recover in situ, and may not be found until downstream screening contexts ([Reinhard and Bryant, 2008](#)).

Feces contain an incredible number of microorganisms—more than a billion viable bacterial cells per milligram of stool ([Ott et al., 2004](#)). As such, feces are highly biologically active and typically decompose rapidly, except under extraordinary circumstances. The immediate post-depositional environment is crucial to coprolite preservation at the biomolecular level. Latrine deposits and soils, which are useful for dietary and parasite analyses, suffer from the same taphonomic challenges. Calcareous deposits, however, such as those recovered from latrine drainage pipes in Pompeii ([Hobson, 2009](#)), may provide a better preservational environment, especially if feces particles become rapidly encrusted with mineral scale, consequently mitigating both the process of decomposition and environmental contamination. Although some coprolites recovered from exceptional contexts (e.g., a mummified colon) may provide insight into personalized health states, most coprolites are not found in association with a particular skeleton. Instead, many coprolites and calcareous deposits are recovered from communal latrine areas or middens, and consequently ancient gut microbiome analysis must be conducted at a population level, rather than on an individual basis.

From the 1930s onward, there have been several attempts to characterize the bacteria within coprolites using both culturing and microscopic techniques. However, these attempts met with limited success due to bacterial cell inviability and the inability to refine bacterial categorization beyond general cellular morphology and a few cell wall chemical properties ([Reinhard and Bryant, 1992](#)). This situation improved in the late 1990s with the availability of PCR and molecular cloning techniques. The first studies to extract ancient DNA from coprolites and amplify a portion of the 16S rRNA gene (rDNA) found sequences that were generally consistent with the families and genera expected for gut bacteria. However, because these studies rarely examined more than a few dozen sequence clones per sample ([Ubaldi et al., 1998](#); [Cano et al., 2000](#); [Poinar et al., 2001](#); [Luciani et al., 2006](#); [Rollo et al., 2007](#)), there were simply too few data to draw community-level conclusions.

[Tito et al. \(2008\)](#) were the first to perform NGS on ancient coprolites. Using two coprolite samples from the Cueva de los Muertos Chiquitos, near the town of Rio Zape in Durango, Mexico, they generated 45,000 shotgun sequences and demonstrated that the ancient Rio Zape coprolites resembled modern feces in both taxonomic and functional profiles. The fecal microbiomes observed in this study raised the question of whether ancient human microbiota may be more biogeographically structured than they are today, a question that has important implications for current attempts to define a 'core' human microbiome ([Arumugam et al., 2011](#); [Huse et al., 2012](#)). [Tito et al. \(2012\)](#) followed up this study with additional targeted 16S rRNA gene deep sequencing of the Rio Zape coprolites, additional coprolites from Hinds Cave, Texas, and mummified human intestinal contents from Caserones, Chile. However, unlike the Rio Zape coprolites, the Hinds Cave coprolites exhibited no resemblance to modern fecal bacteria, and the Caserones sample was most similar to bacterial communities found in

composted organic matter. Their results suggested that while some coprolites preserve authentic gut microbiota, as in the case of the Rio Zape samples, coprolites and intestinal contents in general represent open systems that are susceptible to both self-digestion and bacterial infiltration from the burial environment during decomposition.

Recently, shotgun NGS and scanning electron microscopy (SEM) was applied to medieval coprolites sealed within latrine barrels with the aim of retrieving ancient gut microbiome viruses ([Appelt et al., 2014](#)). By comparing the resulting metagenomic sequences to the NCBI RefSeq Viral Genomes database, several thousand DNA sequences were identified with homology to known viral families, including a few that infect eukaryotes, but mostly belonging to the Siphoviridae family of double-stranded DNA bacteriophages. Although poorly understood, bacteriophages are estimated to outnumber bacterial cells in the human body by an order of magnitude, and these viruses are thought to play a central role in structuring host-associated bacterial populations and indirectly influencing host health ([Fanello et al., 2012](#); [Reyes et al., 2012](#)).

In addition to bacteria and viruses, coprolites also preserve evidence of parasitic infections in the form of microscopically visible helminth eggs, nematode larvae, and adults ([Bouchet et al., 2003](#); [Goncalves et al., 2003](#); [Seo et al., 2007, 2008](#); [Shin et al., 2009a,b](#); [Mitchell, 2013](#)). Additionally, parasite proteins ([Goncalves et al., 2002, 2004](#); [Mitchell et al., 2008](#)) and DNA ([Loreille et al., 2001](#); [Iniguez et al., 2006](#); [Cleeland et al., 2013](#)) can also be detected in coprolites, even in the absence of microscopic parasite remains ([Iniguez et al., 2003](#)). Thus, combined microscopic and biomolecular analyses of coprolites provide a wealth of information about the prevalence, transmission, and evolution of parasitic infections, and offer potential insights into gastrointestinal health, water quality, sanitation, and hygiene practices in the past.

#### Dental calculus

Dental calculus is a calcified bacterial biofilm that forms on the surfaces of teeth, and it is found in all human populations, as well as Miocene apes (12.5–8.5 Ma; [Hershkovitz et al., 1997](#)), Neanderthals ([Pap et al., 1995](#); [Henry et al., 2011](#); [Hardy et al., 2012](#)), wild chimpanzees ([Hardy et al., 2009](#)), and a range of animals ([Dobney and Brothwell, 1987](#); [Middleton and Rovner, 1994](#)). Among humans, both in the past and today when professional dentistry care is not available, the incidence of dental calculus is near-ubiquitous among adults by age 30 ([White, 1997](#); [Lieverse, 1999](#)), and in our experience we have found that it is not uncommon to observe dental calculus deposits in excess of 100 mg in archaeological assemblages of agricultural populations. In addition to being both common and relatively abundant, dental calculus is also a rich source of ancient biomolecules, with extracted DNA yields up to three orders of magnitude greater than from bone or dentine of the same individual ([Warinner et al., 2014a,b](#); see also [Weyrich et al., 2014](#)). This remarkable biomolecular preservation mirrors the structural preservation of archaeological dental calculus, which retains the biological organization, inorganic composition, and remnant organic structures (e.g., cell walls, DNA) observed in the mature dental calculus of living subjects ([Warinner et al., 2014a,b](#)). Importantly, dental calculus is unique among ancient microbiome sources in that it does not shed, remodel, or turnover; rather, it forms incrementally through serial deposition and mineralization in situ ([White, 1991](#)), making it a layered record of human life history specific to each person.

The excellent preservation of biomolecules within dental calculus is likely due to several factors. First, dental calculus is not a material that is easily colonized or consumed by environmental bacteria. It lacks biological channels, such as Haversian canals,

cannaliculi, or dentinal tubules that typically provide postmortem points of entry and movement for exogenous bacteria within bones and teeth, and it also lacks a rich organic nutrient source, such as bone marrow or dental pulp, to attract and support environmental bacterial growth and facilitate decomposition (Turner-Walker, 2008). A second important factor is the fact that dental calculus begins the process of fossilization long before the host organism dies (Jin and Yip, 2002; Jepsen et al., 2011). As dental plaque biofilms grow, restricted nutrient diffusion to the interior leads to bacterial death and the subsequent deactivation of membrane-bound ATP-dependent ion pumps. High intracellular phosphate concentrations lead to calcium diffusion into the cells in excess of calcium phosphate saturation, resulting in rapid intracellular mineralization (White, 1997) and the interruption of enzymatic and hydrolytic processes associated with decomposition. Meanwhile, extracellular calcium phosphate mineralization proceeds in parallel, effectively entombing bacterial cells within crystal aggregates. Thus, by the time dental calculus is exposed to a postmortem depositional environment it has long been non-vital and biologically inert. Third, the mineral composition and large crystal sizes within dental calculus also likely contribute to the long-term preservation of in situ DNA within this mineralized biofilm. Similar to bone and dentine, calcium phosphates account for 75–80% of the dry weight of mature dental calculus (Schroeder, 1969); however, unlike bone or dentine, these calcium phosphates are present in multiple phases and are typically ordered into a diversity of needle-like and plate-like crystal aggregates. Individual crystallites typically measure 10–300 nm in length and 2–30 nm in width (Schroeder, 1969); this is larger than hydroxyapatite crystals found in bone, which typically measure no more than 55 nm in their largest dimension (Clarke, 2008; Nudelman et al., 2010). Calcium phosphate is known to efficiently bind DNA, and this property has been exploited in molecular biology where calcium phosphate is used as a carrier compound in DNA transfection (Kingston et al., 2003) and as a binding substrate in DNA extraction and purification (Herzer, 2001; Yu et al., 2008). Finally, once mineralized, dental calculus becomes cement-like both in hardness and adhesive strength, making it extremely resistant to decay or removal (White, 1997; Jin and Yip, 2002; Jepsen et al., 2011).

Following electron microscopy imaging of modern dental calculus in the 1960s and 1970s (Schroeder, 1969; Jones, 1972; Lustmann et al., 1976), it was recognized that microorganisms within human, Neanderthal, and extinct primate dental calculus could be imaged and morphologically characterized using SEM (Brothwell, 1972; Dobney and Brothwell, 1986, 1988; Hansen et al., 1991; Dobney, 1994; Vandermeersch et al., 1994; Pap et al., 1995; Arensburg, 1996; Hershkovitz et al., 1997) and later direct optical techniques (Linossier et al., 1996; Charlier et al., 2010). Biomolecular investigations of calculus began with immunohistochemical analysis of *Streptococcus mutans* (Linossier et al., 1996), followed by gold-labeled antibody transmission electron microscopy (TEM) of in situ DNA (Preus et al., 2011) and PCR-based analyses targeting specific oral taxa, including *Actinomyces naeslundii*, *Fusobacterium nucleatum*, *Streptococcus gordonii*, *Porphyromonas gingivalis* and *S. mutans* (De La Fuente et al., 2012; Adler et al., 2013).

Adler et al. (2013) performed the first NGS analysis of ancient dental calculus and demonstrated that dental calculus could be used to characterize ancient oral microbiomes. Amplifying the 16S rRNA gene third hypervariable region (V3), they performed phylum-level comparisons of dental calculus bacteria in Mesolithic, Neolithic, Bronze Age, medieval and modern samples, and reported ecological shifts in Gram-positive members of the oral microbiome corresponding to the origins of agriculture and the Industrial Revolution. Subsequently, Warinner (2014a) used shotgun metagenomic and

metaproteomic approaches, in combination with 16S rRNA gene deep sequencing, to reconstruct a species-level taxonomic and protein functional characterization of medieval dental calculus samples. Their study revealed that the oral microbiome has long served as a reservoir for a diverse range of opportunistic pathogens and putative low-level antibiotic resistance genes. From these data they were able to characterize active periodontal disease based on metaproteomic evidence of bacterial virulence factors and host immune activity, and reconstruct the genome of the periodontal pathogen *Tannerella forsythia*. Considering the near ubiquity of dental calculus in the Quaternary paleontological and archaeological records, these studies provide a first glimpse at the potential wealth of evolutionary and health information that ancient oral microbiome research is likely to provide as more geographically and temporally diverse populations are investigated.

#### Other potential sources of ancient microbiome data

**Historic medical specimens** Although limited to the past few centuries, medical specimens of human tissue represent an additional source of historic human microbiome samples. Usually preserved in liquid alcohol or formaldehyde or stored in formalin-fixed paraffin-embedded (FFPE) blocks, these samples include anatomical and pathological specimens ranging from whole bodies to complete or partial organs to tissue biopsies. Morphological preservation of these specimens is typically good, but molecular preservation may be adversely affected by specific chemicals used during tissue fixation and storage, such as formalin (Gilbert et al., 2007). Recently, genetic sequences of *Vibrio cholerae*, the causative agent of cholera, were recovered from an alcohol-preserved medical specimen of colon dating to 1849 CE (Devault et al., 2014). Such studies suggest that microbiome characterization from historical medical specimens is feasible. Historic medical specimens may prove to be particularly valuable for accessing microbiome body sites that rarely preserve in the archaeological record, such as the small intestine and proximal colon, as well as the reproductive organs and structures. **Mummified human remains** Naturally and artificially mummified remains provide an additional potential source of human microbiota, including those of the skin, lungs, stomach, and other organs and structures. However, despite gross preservation at a macroscopic scale, mummified tissues are still susceptible to the same microscopic and molecular taphonomic processes as other ancient tissues, and attempts to date to analyze microbiota from these sources have yielded mixed results. In analyzing the microbiota of the Tyrolean Ice Man, for example, Rollo et al. (2000, 2007) found that bacteria collected from the skin and stomach were consistent with environmental contamination, while bacteria obtained from the colon yielded 16S rRNA gene sequences consistent with human gut bacteria. Meanwhile, Castillo-Rojas et al. (2008) analyzed gastric samples of a pre-Columbian mummy in Chihuahua, Mexico and successfully PCR-amplified genetic markers for *Helicobacter pylori*, the causative agent of stomach ulcers. Recently, Corthals et al. (2012) applied shotgun proteomics to labial swabs from two 500-year-old Andean mummies and identified several human proteins expressed in saliva. Using targeted PCR, they also recovered several *Mycobacterium* sequences, although whether these sequences originated from pathogenic or environmental taxa is unclear.

**Secondary deposition in bone** A corollary to the idea that environmental bacteria may infiltrate and alter coprolite microbial communities is the idea that gut microbiome bacteria may leak out of the colon and fecal material and infiltrate bones shortly after death (Bell et al., 1996). The gastrointestinal community composition changes radically after death (Heimesaat et al., 2012), and members of this

community appear in the blood within 24 h postmortem (Saegeman et al., 2009; Heimesaat et al., 2012). Jans (2008) demonstrated that spongiform (microbial) alteration is common in articulated skeletons but rare in disarticulated skeletons, supporting the hypothesis that putrefying bacteria released into the abdominal cavity from the gut are the primary initiators of early stage diagenesis (Turner-Walker, 2008). Hypothetically, these bacteria could then later become entrapped within the bone matrix during taphonomic processes of demineralization and remineralization. Apatite is mobilized but retained and reprecipitated within the bone, apparently around microbial cell membranes (Turner-Walker and Syversen, 2002), potentially leading to long-term molecular preservation. If true, bone could serve as a trap for some gut microbiome bacteria and provide partial access to these bacteria even in the absence of mummified gastrointestinal contents or coprolites. The skeletal remains of infants and young children might serve as an interesting test of this hypothesis, as their gut microbiome is dominated by vaginal and skin bacteria for the first few years of life (Dominguez-Bello et al., 2010; Koenig et al., 2011), and thus should be readily distinguishable. The bacterial composition of bone, however, is complex and likely of heterogeneous origin. Recently analyzed microbial profiles from Neanderthal bone (Zaremba-Niedzwiedzka and Andersson, 2013), permafrost horse bone and dentine (Der Sarkissian et al., 2014), and medieval human bone and dentine (Warinner et al., 2014a,b) were found to be dominated by organisms typical of environmental rather than human microbiome sources. Future studies will be required to determine to what degree mortuary architecture or furniture, such as tomb or coffin use, may increase the amount of human microbiota found within bone, considering that such structures physically retain host-associated bacteria within close proximity of the corpse and limit the exposure of the corpse to environmental bacteria (Duday and Guillon, 2006; Janaway et al., 2009).

#### Host considerations

In addition to serving as sources of preserved microbiomes, dental calculus and coprolites also contain variable quantities of host DNA, protein, and metabolites. Human DNA within coprolites (presumably from shed epithelial cells of the gastrointestinal tract) may make up as much as 50% of the total DNA in well-preserved samples (Bon et al., 2012). Host biomolecules have been used to validate the coprolite species of origin (Wood et al., 2008; Bon et al., 2012) and to identify and date the presence of humans at early Paleolithic sites where few cultural artifacts are present (Gilbert et al., 2008). Steroidal hormones like estrogen, testosterone, progesterone, and estradiol have been detected in coprolites using radioimmunoassay procedures (Sobolik et al., 1996; Rhode, 2003). Additionally, bacterial cholesterol metabolites, such as coprostanol, can be recovered from ancient coprolites and latrines (Bull et al., 1999), and may be informative of cardiovascular disease risk (Veiga et al., 2005). Finally, considering that cortisol and other steroid hormones can be routinely and non-invasively collected from wildlife fecal samples to study adrenocortical activity (Mostl and Palme, 2002; Millspaugh and Washburn, 2004), human coprolites may also provide insight into the physiological stress and reproduction of ancient populations.

Host DNA within dental calculus is only beginning to be explored (e.g., Kawano et al., 1995; De La Fuente et al., 2012) and seems to account for approximately 0.5% of DNA in ancient dental calculus and 0–2.5% in modern dental plaque (Warinner et al., 2014a,b). There are many possible ways that host DNA could become incorporated into dental calculus given that dental plaque is continuously bathed in host saliva and gingival crevicular fluid,

but interestingly host proteins identified within both modern and ancient dental calculus suggest that immunological activity and the release of neutrophil extracellular traps (NETosis) may be the dominant method (Warinner, 2014a). Neutrophils are the primary immune cell type involved in host defense against plaque/calculus bacteria, and during NETosis neutrophils undergo a specialized form of programmed cell death in which they use chromatin DNA as a structural web or net-like material to distribute bactericidal proteins onto advancing plaque deposits (Ryder, 2010; Remijsen et al., 2011; Brinkmann and Zychlinsky, 2012; Branzk and Papayannopoulos, 2013). The result of this process is that host DNA and a wide range of bactericidal proteins become embedded within the dental calculus matrix, but structural and housekeeping proteins of the neutrophil cell are largely absent. As a consequence of this dynamic immunological process, dental calculus represents an important additional source of host biomolecules in the archaeological record that may prove useful for understanding host genomic and proteomic aspects of health and disease.

The ability to recover both human and microbial DNA from the same archaeological substrate provides an exciting potential to investigate the relationships between host genotype and microbiome composition, function, and evolution. While several studies have investigated the role of host genetic variation in determining susceptibility to common diseases (Barnes et al., 2011; Chapman and Hill, 2012), genome wide studies are only beginning to elucidate the role of host genotype in modulating microbiota composition (Xavier and Podolsky, 2007; Benson et al., 2010; Spor et al., 2011). As we improve our understanding of the complex relationship between host genotype and microbiome composition, coprolites and dental calculus will provide new avenues for exploring the environmental and genetic factors that shape host-associated microbial diversity and health states in ancient populations.

#### Dietary and life history information preserved in microbiome substrates

There is a growing understanding of the role that diet plays in structuring our microbiomes. Not only does the gut microbiome play a major role in digestion, vitamin production, and energy sequestration, but individual dietary choices also influence gut microbiome composition. Differences in the relative proportions of bile-tolerant organisms (e.g., *Bacteroides*) and/or plant polysaccharide metabolizers (e.g., *Prevotella*) have been observed among individuals consuming vegan, vegetarian, and 'omnivorous' diets (Zimmer et al., 2012), as well as between rural and urban populations (Yatsunenko et al., 2012). Moreover, in controlled feeding studies, shifts to predominantly plant- or animal-based diets produced observable changes in the human gut microbiome within as little as 24 h (Wu et al., 2011; David et al., 2014). Despite the plasticity of the gut microbiome, however, microbial composition is constrained by host biology, and dietary effects are typically secondary to host evolutionary relationships in the determination of microbiome structure. For example, despite consuming a diet nearly entirely composed of bamboo, pandas retain a carnivore-like gut microbiome (Ley et al., 2008), which is augmented by cellulose-metabolizing taxa (Zhu et al., 2011).

Diet also plays a role in shaping the composition of oral microbiomes, most notably by the action of dietary sugar in promoting the growth of cariogenic bacteria such as lactobacilli and *S. mutans* (Vågstrand and Birkhed, 2007). Two recent papers have proposed that cariogenic bacteria, such as *S. mutans*, were absent in pre-Neolithic human populations, possibly indicating low carbohydrate diets (Soltysiak, 2012; Adler et al., 2013), while evolutionary genomic analyses of *S. mutans* suggest an expansion in this species approximately 10,000 years ago, coinciding with the onset of

agriculture (Cornejo et al., 2013). Furthermore, research in dental anthropology as well as in vitro studies indicate that diets rich in starch and oil may enhance oral calcification and calculus formation (Lieveise, 1999; Hidaka and Oishi, 2007; Hidaka et al., 2008).

Importantly, coprolites and dental calculus also contain direct evidence of ancient diets. Ancient feces preserve dietary microfossils, such as undigested or indigestible plant, animal, and fish remains (Callen and Martin, 1969; Fry, 1985; Holden, 1991), microfossils, such as pollen and phytoliths (Reinhard and Bryant, 1992), and dietary DNA molecules (Poinar et al., 1998, 2001; Wood et al., 2008; Bon et al., 2012). Likewise, dental calculus entraps plant microfossils and environmental debris, including plant phytoliths (Fox et al., 1994, 1996), starches (Boyadjian et al., 2007; Henry and Piperno, 2008; Piperno and Dillehay, 2008; Hardy et al., 2009, 2012; Henry et al., 2011), and fibers (Blatt et al., 2011), providing evidence for the consumption of starchy soft plant foods that otherwise rarely preserve in the archaeological record, including tubers, rhizomes, squashes, and legumes (Piperno and Dillehay, 2008; Mickleburgh and Pagán-Jiménez, 2012). Dental calculus has also been shown to preserve DNA and proteins from ancient dietary plant and animal sources (Warinner et al., 2014a,b), such as bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum*) *Brassica* sp., a genus in the cabbage family, and ruminant milk. By preserving both direct evidence of consumed foods and associated microbiomes within a single substrate, we now have the ability to examine the link between diet and microbiota at the level of the individual, and examine how major historical shifts in food acquisition, production, and consumption shaped our microbiomes.

## The future of ancient microbiome studies

### *Ancestral state of the human microbiome*

There can be no doubt that modern behavior and dietary changes are altering the microbial ecology of humans. While some of these changes could be beneficial, others are disruptive (Cho and Blaser, 2012) and may be a driving force behind the rapidly increasing rates of chronic inflammatory diseases in developed countries (Jones et al., 2012). Common medical interventions, such as antibiotic therapy, have dramatically reduced infectious disease burdens worldwide. However, rather than being targeted strikes against harmful bacteria alone, such therapies can also act as weapons of mass microbial disruption (Dethlefsen and Relman, 2011; Sommer and Dantas, 2011). Broad-spectrum antibiotic usage is increasingly being linked to more subtle microbial disruptions that, in extreme cases, such as antibiotic-associated diarrhea and pseudomembranous colitis, can result in serious and persistent microbiome disturbances (Lo Vecchio and Zacur, 2012). While we accept this disruption as intuitive, there are few pathways to deciphering how exactly human microbiomes have changed over the past decades, centuries, and millennia.

Within the context of anthropology, researchers have conventionally approached such questions regarding the anatomical and behavioral evolution of modern humans by observing our closest living relatives, the non-human primates, and by partnering with extant traditional peoples engaging in diverse lifeways. However, both approaches have advantages and drawbacks. In the context of microbiome research, even the most traditional peoples have been arguably affected by industrialization and globalization, while those peoples that have been minimally influenced typically live in very restricted environments, such as deep in the Amazon jungle. Additionally, the most recent common ancestor of humans and their closest living primate cousins, the chimpanzees, lived at least 6.5 million years ago and perhaps even earlier (Venn et al., 2014), allowing ample time for distinct microbial evolutionary trajectories.

Ancient microbiome research provides an additional pathway to understanding human biology that cannot be achieved by studies of extant individuals and related species alone. Although reconstructing the ancestral microbiome by studying our ancestors directly is not without challenges (Tito et al., 2012), this approach provides a more direct picture of human-microbe coevolution. Likewise, ancient microbiome sources may reveal to what extent bacteria commonly considered ‘pathogenic’ in the modern world (for example, *H. pylori*) were endemic indigenous organisms in pre-Industrial microbiomes (Hadley, 2006).

The three paths to reconstructing the ancestral microbiomes are also complimentary. For example, analysis of the gut microbiome from extant, rural peoples in Africa and South America have revealed the presence of a common, potentially commensal, spirochete belonging to the genus *Treponema* (De Filippo et al., 2010; Yatsunenkov et al., 2012). Such spirochetes have also been detected in extant hunter-gatherers (Schnorr et al., 2014) and in 1,000-year-old human coprolites from Mexico (Tito et al., 2012), but they are essentially absent from healthy urban populations, and they have not been reported in the gut microbiome of chimpanzees (Moeller et al., 2012). These multiple lines of evidence suggest that this poorly understood spirochete is a member of the ancestral human microbiome, yet not necessarily the broader primate microbiome. Future coprolite research may be able to answer the question of how long this microbe has co-associated with humans, and what niche it fills.

### *Microbiomes and speciation*

Since the availability of DNA sequencing technologies, investigations of the molecular processes of evolution and speciation have focused on the genes and genomes of particular species. However, an increasing appreciation of the role of the microbiome in organism fitness and success (Brucker and Bordenstein, 2012; Ezenwa et al., 2012; McFall-Ngai et al., 2013) is challenging this approach, and there are compelling arguments (Brucker and Bordenstein, 2012) for incorporating the microbiome into the classic biological species concept (Mayr, 1963), in accordance with the hologenome theory of evolution (Zilber-Rosenberg and Rosenberg, 2008). Recently, aspects of this theory have been empirically tested in *Nasonia* wasps, where the microbiome was found to play a central role in hybrid lethality and speciation (Brucker and Bordenstein, 2013). Although research in this area is still in an early phase, the implications of such findings are profound and raise questions about the role of the microbiome in human evolution. Recent evidence of archaic *Homo* genetic introgression into anatomically modern humans (Reich et al., 2010; Sankararaman et al., 2012; Huerta-Sánchez et al., 2014) indicates both direct contact and limited interbreeding among multiple species of the genus *Homo*, and at least one study has indicated transmission of parasites (lice) between archaic and modern humans (Reed et al., 2004). Dental calculus has been documented in primates dating as far back as the Miocene (Hershkovitz et al., 1997), and a 50,000-year-old coprolite associated with Neanderthals was recently discovered in Spain (Sistiaga et al., 2014), demonstrating that microbiome substrates are available for analysis. Investigating these ancient microbiomes may yield important insights into the evolution of the human lineage and clarify how *Homo sapiens* came to be the only species within our genus to survive into the Holocene.

### *Evolution of human microbial commensals and pathogens*

The advent of NGS, coupled with DNA hybridization capture techniques, has enabled the complete genome reconstruction of a

number of historic pathogens infecting humans (*Yersinia pestis*, *Mycobacterium leprae*, *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, and *T. forsythia*) from a variety of ancient sources, including archaeological bone, dentine, and dental calculus, as well as museum-curated herbarium specimens (Bos et al., 2011; Donoghue, 2013; Warinner et al., 2014a,b). As our technological and bioinformatic capabilities grow, it will become possible to move beyond this handful of pathogens to recover the genomes of myriad commensal and endemic microbiota.

Importantly, coprolites and especially calculus represent reliable and abundant sources of directly datable bacterial genomes from a wide variety of microorganisms including archaea, bacteria, and fungi. Not only can these complete ancient genomes provide important phylogenetic data, but they also provide the means for calibrating molecular clocks of bacterial evolution. While current bacterial dating methods primarily rely on the geological record (e.g., speciation because of island formation) or medical specimen collection dates (Bromham and Penny, 2003), these approaches limit dating to substrates that are either extremely old (on a geological time scale, with very wide temporal error ranges) or fairly young (generally within the past century). Bacterial genomes recovered from Quaternary deposits, therefore, represent a key middle ground. Moreover, as microbiomes generally reflect complex ecological communities, coprolites and calculus provide key substrates for analyzing the rate of horizontal gene transfer, as well as the evolution of mechanisms underlying anti-microbial resistance (D'Costa et al., 2011; Warinner et al., 2014a,b).

## Conclusion

Characterizing ancient human microbiomes is more complex than a simple binary present to past comparison and will instead require a time-series approach linked to major moments in human development and innovation, from migrations out of Africa, admixture with archaic humans, refining tool technologies, domesticating, and industrializing. Our goal now should be to discover if and how each of these pivotal moments in human history and prehistory reflect moments where our relationship with microbes was changed. Fortunately, substrates such as dental calculus appear to preserve well and are nearly as ubiquitous as the skeletal material itself, with globally diverse distributions through time. There is now a wealth of ancient human microbiome information available to us, which is providing a more complete picture of human biology and evolution. The future for ancient microbiome research is very bright indeed.

## Acknowledgments

This work was supported by the NIH HHS/United States (R01 GM089886).

## References

- Aas, J.A., Griffen, A.L., Dardis, S.R., Lee, A.M., Olsen, I., Dewhirst, F.E., Leys, E.J., Paster, B.J., 2008. Bacteria of dental caries in primary and permanent teeth in children and young adults. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* 46 (4), 1407–1417.
- Adler, C.J., Dobney, K., Weyrich, L.S., Kaidonis, J., Walker, A.W., Haak, W., Bradshaw, C.J., Townsend, G., Soltysiak, A., Alt, K.W., Parkhill, J., Cooper, A., 2013. Sequencing ancient calcified dental plaque shows changes in oral microbiota with dietary shifts of the Neolithic and Industrial revolutions. *Nat. Genet.* 45, 450–455.
- Appelt, S., Fancello, L., Le Bailly, M., Raoult, D., Drancourt, M., Desnues, C., 2014. Viruses in a 14th-century coprolite. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 80 (9), 2648–2655.
- Arensburg, B., 1996. Ancient dental calculus and diet. *Hum. Evol.* 11 (2), 139–145.
- Arumugam, M., Raes, J., Pelletier, E., Le Paslier, D., Yamada, T., Mende, D.R., Fernandes, G.R., Tap, J., Bruls, T., Batto, J.M., Bertalan, M., Borruel, N., Casellas, F., Fernandez, L., Gautier, L., Hansen, T., Hattori, M., Hayashi, T., Kleerebezem, M., Kurokawa, K., Leclerc, M., Levenez, F., Manichanh, C., Nielsen, H.B., Nielsen, T., Pons, N., Poulain, J., Qin, J.J., Sicheritz-Ponten, T., Tims, S., Torrents, D., Ugarte, E., Zoetendal, E.G., Wang, J., Guarner, F., Pedersen, O., de Vos, W.M., Brunak, S., Dore, J., Weissenbach, J., Ehrlich, S.D., Bork, P., MetaHIT Consortium, 2011. Enterotypes of the human gut microbiome. *Nature* 473 (7346), 174–180.
- Baquero, F., Nombela, C., 2012. The microbiome as a human organ. *Clin. Microbiol. Infect.* 18, 2–4.
- Barnes, I., Duda, A., Pybus, O.G., Thomas, M.G., 2011. Ancient urbanization predicts genetic resistance to tuberculosis. *Evolution* 65 (3), 842–848.
- Bell, L.S., Skinner, M.F., Jones, S.J., 1996. The speed of post mortem change to the human skeleton and its taphonomic significance. *Forensic Sci. Int.* 82 (2), 129–140.
- Benson, A.K., Kelly, S.A., Legge, R., Ma, F., Low, S.J., Kim, J., Zhang, M., Oh, P.L., Nehrenberg, D., Hua, K., Kachman, S.D., Moriyama, E.N., Walter, J., Peterson, D.A., Pomp, D., 2010. Individuality in gut microbiota composition is a complex polygenic trait shaped by multiple environmental and host genetic factors. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 107 (44), 18933–18938.
- Bianconi, E., Piovesan, A., Facchin, F., Beraudi, A., Casadei, R., Frabetti, F., Vitale, L., Pelleri, M.C., Tassani, S., Piva, F., Perez-Amadio, S., Strippoli, P., Canaider, S., 2013. An estimation of the number of cells in the human body. *Annl. Hum. Biol.* 40 (6), 463–471.
- Blaser, M., Bork, P., Fraser, C., Knight, R., Wang, J., 2013. The microbiome explored: recent insights and future challenges. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 11 (3), 213–217.
- Blatt, S.H., Redmond, B.G., Cassman, V., Sciuilli, P.W., 2011. Dirty teeth and ancient trade: evidence of cotton fibres in human dental calculus from Late Woodland, Ohio. *Int. J. Osteoarchaeol.* 21 (6), 669–678.
- Bon, C., Berthouard, V., Maksud, F., Labadie, K., Poulain, J., Artiguenave, F., Wincker, P., Aury, J.M., Elalouf, J.M., 2012. Coprolites as a source of information on the genome and diet of the cave hyena. *Proc. R. Soc. (Biol.)* 279 (1739), 2825–2830.
- Bos, K.I., Schuenemann, V.J., Golding, G.B., Burbano, H.A., Waglechner, N., Coombes, B.K., McPhee, J.B., DeWitte, S.N., Meyer, M., Schmedes, S., Wood, J., Earn, D.J., Herring, D.A., Bauer, P., Poinar, H.N., Krause, J., 2011. A draft genome of *Yersinia pestis* from victims of the Black Death. *Nature* 478 (7370), 506–510.
- Bouchet, F., Guidon, N., Dittmar, K., Harter, S., Ferreira, L.F., Chaves, S.M., Reinhard, K., Araujo, A., 2003. Parasite remains in archaeological sites. *Mem. I Oswaldo Cruz* 98, 47–52.
- Boyadjian, C.H.C., Eggers, S., Reinhard, K., 2007. Dental wash: a problematic method for extracting microfossils from teeth. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 34 (10), 1622–1628.
- Branzk, N., Papayannopoulos, V., 2013. Molecular mechanisms regulating NETosis in infection and disease. *Semin. Immunopathol.* 35 (4), 513–530.
- Brinkmann, V., Zychlinsky, A., 2012. Neutrophil extracellular traps: is immunity the second function of chromatin? *J. Cell Biol.* 198 (5), 773–783.
- Bromham, L., Penny, D., 2003. The modern molecular clock. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 4 (3), 216–224.
- Brothwell, D., 1972. Digging up Bones. London Museum, London.
- Brotman, R.M., 2011. Vaginal microbiome and sexually transmitted infections: an epidemiologic perspective. *J. Clin. Invest.* 121 (12), 4610–4617.
- Brucker, R.M., Bordenstein, S.R., 2012. Speciation by symbiosis. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 27 (8), 443–451.
- Brucker, R.M., Bordenstein, S.R., 2013. The hologenomic basis of speciation: gut bacteria cause hybrid lethality in the genus *Nasonia*. *Science* 341 (6146), 667–669.
- Bull, I.D., Simpson, I.A., Van Bergen, P.F., Evershed, R.P., 1999. Muck-'n'-molecules: organic geochemical methods for detecting ancient manuring. *Antiquity* 73 (279), 86–96.
- Callen, E.O., Martin, P.S., 1969. Plant remains in some coprolites from Utah. *Am. Antiq.* 34 (3), 329–331.
- Cano, R.J., Tiefenbrunner, F., Ubaldi, M., Del Cueto, C., Luciani, S., Cox, T., Orkand, P., Kunzel, K.H., Rollo, F., 2000. Sequence analysis of bacterial DNA in the colon and stomach of the Tyrolean Iceman. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 112 (3), 297–309.
- Carlet, J., 2012. The gut is the epicentre of antibiotic resistance. *Antimicrob. Resist. Infect. Control* 1 (1), 39.
- Castillo-Rojas, G., Cerbon, M.A., Lopez-Vidal, Y., 2008. Presence of *Helicobacter pylori* in a Mexican pre-Columbian mummy. *BMC Microbiol.* 8 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/1471-2180-8-119>.
- Chapman, S.J., Hill, A.V.S., 2012. Human genetic susceptibility to infectious disease. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 13 (3), 175–188.
- Charlier, P., Huynh-Charlier, I., Munoz, O., Billard, M., Brun, L., de la Grandmaison, G.L., 2010. The microscopic (optical and SEM) examination of dental calculus deposits (DCD). Potential interest in forensic anthropology of a bio-archaeological method. *Leg. Med. (Tokyo)* 12 (4), 163–171.
- Chin, K., Tokaryk, T.T., Erickson, G.M., Calk, L.C., 1998. A king-sized theropod coprolite. *Nature* 393 (6686), 680–682.
- Cho, I., Blaser, M.J., 2012. Applications of next-generation sequencing the human microbiome: at the interface of health and disease. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 13 (4), 260–270.
- Clarke, B., 2008. Normal bone anatomy and physiology. *Clin. J. Am. Soc. Nephro.* 3, S131–S139.
- Clelland, L.M., Reichard, M.V., Tito, R.Y., Reinhard, K.J., Lewis, C.M., 2013. Clarifying prehistoric parasitism from a complementary morphological and molecular approach. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 40 (7), 3060–3066.
- Clemente, J.C., Ursell, L.K., Parfrey, L.W., Knight, R., 2012. The impact of the gut microbiota on human health: an integrative view. *Cell* 148 (6), 1258–1270.



- Contreras, M., Costello, E.K., Hidalgo, G., Magris, M., Knight, R., Dominguez-Bello, M.G., 2010. The bacterial microbiota in the oral mucosa of rural Amerindians. *Microbiology* 156, 3282–3287.
- Cornejo, O.E., Lefebvre, T., Bitar, P.D., Lang, P., Richards, V.P., Eilertson, K., Do, T., Beighton, D., Zeng, L., Ahn, S.J., Burne, R.A., Siepel, A., Bustamante, C.D., Stanhope, M.J., 2013. Evolutionary and population genomics of the cavity causing bacteria *Streptococcus mutans*. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 30 (4), 881–893.
- Corthals, A., Koller, A., Martin, D.W., Rieger, R., Chen, E.I., Bernaski, M., Recagno, G., Davalos, L.M., 2012. Detecting the immune system response of a 500 year-old Inca mummy. *PLoS One* 7 (7), e41244.
- D'Costa, V.M., King, C.E., Kalan, L., Morar, M., Sung, W.W., Schwarz, C., Froese, D., Zazula, G., Calmels, F., Debruyne, R., Golding, G.B., Poinar, H.N., Wright, G.D., 2011. Antibiotic resistance is ancient. *Nature* 477 (7365), 457–461.
- David, L.A., Maurice, C.F., Carmody, R.N., Gootenberg, D.B., Button, J.E., Wolfe, B.E., Ling, A.V., Devlin, A.S., Varma, Y., Fischbach, M.A., Biddinger, S.B., Dutton, R.J., Turnbaugh, P.J., 2014. Diet rapidly and reproducibly alters the human gut microbiome. *Nature* 505 (7484), 559–563.
- De Filippo, C., Cavalieri, D., Di Paola, M., Ramazzotti, M., Poullet, J.B., Massart, S., Collini, S., Pieraccini, G., Lionetti, P., 2010. Impact of diet in shaping gut microbiota revealed by a comparative study in children from Europe and rural Africa. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 107 (33), 14691–14696.
- De La Fuente, C.P., Flores, S.V., Moraga, M.L., 2012. Human bacterial DNA from dental calculus: a new source of genetic material. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 147, 127.
- Dentzien-Dias, P.C., Poinar, G., de Figueiredo, A.E.Q., Pacheco, A.C.L., Horn, B.L.D., Schultz, C.L., 2013. Tapeworm eggs in a 270 million-year-old shark coprolite. *PLoS One* 8 (1).
- Der Sarkissian, C., Ermini, L., Jónsson, H., Alekseev, A., Crubezy, E., Shapiro, B., Orlando, L., 2014. Shotgun microbial profiling of fossil remains. *Mol. Ecol.* 23 (7), 1780–1798.
- Dethlefsen, L., Relman, D.A., 2011. Incomplete recovery and individualized responses of the human distal gut microbiota to repeated antibiotic perturbation. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108, 4554–4561.
- Devaraj, S., Hemarajata, P., Versalovic, J., 2013. The human gut microbiome and body metabolism: implications for obesity and diabetes. *Clin. Chem.* 59 (4), 617–628.
- Devault, A.M., McLoughlin, K., Jaing, C., Gardner, S., Porter, T.M., Enk, J.M., Thissen, J., Allen, J., Borucki, M., DeWitte, S.N., Dhody, A.N., Poinar, H.N., 2014. Ancient pathogen DNA in archaeological samples detected with a Microbial Detection Array. *Sci. Rep.* 4, 4245.
- Dewhurst, F.E., Chen, T., Izard, J., Paster, B.J., Tanner, A.C., Yu, W.H., Lakshmanan, A., Wade, W.G., 2010. The human oral microbiome. *J. Bacteriol.* 192 (19), 5002–5017.
- Dobney, K., 1994. Study of the dental calculus. In: Lilley, J., Stroud, G., Brothwell, D., Williamson, M. (Eds.), *The Jewish Burial Ground at Jewbury*. Council for British Archaeology, York.
- Dobney, K., Brothwell, D., 1986. Dental calculus: its relevance to ancient diet and oral ecology. In: *Teeth and Anthropology*. British Archaeological Reports International Series 291. Archaeopress, Oxford, pp. 55–81.
- Dobney, K., Brothwell, D., 1987. A method for evaluating the amount of dental calculus on teeth from archaeological sites. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 14 (4), 343–351.
- Dobney, K., Brothwell, D., 1988. A scanning electron microscope study of archaeological dental calculus. In: *Scanning electron microscopy in archaeology*. British Archaeological Reports International Series. Archaeopress, Oxford, pp. 372–385.
- Dominguez-Bello, M.G., Costello, E.K., Contreras, M., Magris, M., Hidalgo, G., Fierer, N., Knight, R., 2010. Delivery mode shapes the acquisition and structure of the initial microbiota across multiple body habitats in newborns. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 107 (26), 11971–11975.
- Donoghue, H.D., 2013. Insights into ancient leprosy and tuberculosis using metagenomics. *Trends Microbiol.* 21 (9), 448–450.
- Duday, H., Guillon, M., 2006. Understanding the circumstances of decomposition when the body is skeletonized. In: Schmitt, A., Cunha, E., Pinheiro, J. (Eds.), *Forensic Anthropology and Medicine*. Springer, New York, pp. 117–157.
- El-Ansary, A., Shaker, G., Rizk, M., 2013. Role of gut-brain axis in the aetiology of neurodevelopmental disorders with reference to autism. *J. Clin. Toxicol.* 56, 2161–2165.
- Ezenwa, V.O., Gerardo, N.M., Inouye, D.W., Medina, M., Xavier, J.B., 2012. Animal behavior and the microbiome. *Science* 338 (6104), 198–199.
- Fancello, L., Raoult, D., Desnues, C., 2012. Computational tools for viral metagenomics and their application in clinical research. *Virology* 434 (2), 162–174.
- Fitz-Gibbon, S., Tomida, S., Chiu, B.H., Nguyen, L., Du, C., Liu, M.H., Elashoff, D., Erfe, M.C., Loncaric, A., Kim, J., Modlin, R.L., Miller, J.F., Sodergren, E., Craft, N., Weinstock, G.M., Li, H.Y., 2013. Propionibacterium acnes strain populations in the human skin microbiome associated with acne. *J. Invest. Dermatol.* 133 (9), 2152–2160.
- Foster, J.A., Neufeld, K.A.M., 2013. Gut-brain: how the microbiome influences anxiety and depression. *Trends Neurosci.* 36 (5), 305–312.
- Fox, C.L., Pérez-Pérez, A., Juan, J., 1994. Dietary information through the examination of plant phytoliths on the enamel surface of human dentition. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 21 (1), 29–34.
- Fox, C.L., Juan, J., Albert, R.M., 1996. Phytolith analysis on dental calculus, enamel surface, and burial soil: information about diet and paleoenvironment. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 101 (1), 101–113.
- Fry, G.F., 1985. Analysis of fecal material. In: Gilbertand, R.I., Mielke, J.H. (Eds.), *The Analysis of Prehistoric Diets*. Academic Press, Orlando, pp. 127–154.
- Gilbert, M.T.P., Sanchez, J.J., Haselkorn, T., Laurence, D.J., Lucas, S.B., Van Marck, E., Borsting, C., Morling, N., Worobey, M., 2007. Multiplex PCR with mini-sequencing as an effective high-throughput SNP typing method for formalin-fixed tissue. *Electrophoresis* 28 (14), 2361–2367.
- Gilbert, M.T.P., Jenkins, D.L., Gothenstrom, A., Naveran, N., Sanchez, J.J., Hofreiter, M., Thomsen, P.F., Binladen, J., Higham, T.F.G., Yohe, R.M., Parr, R., Cummings, L.S., Willerslev, E., 2008. DNA from pre-Clovis human coprolites in Oregon, North America. *Science* 320 (5877), 786–789.
- Goncalves, M.L.C., Araujo, A., Duarte, R., da Silva, J.P., Reinhard, K., Bouchet, F., Ferreira, L.F., 2002. Detection of *Giardia duodenalis* antigen in coprolites using a commercially available enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay. *Trans. R. Soc. Trop. Med. H* 96 (6), 640–643.
- Goncalves, M.L.C., Araujo, A., Ferreira, L.F., 2003. Human intestinal parasites in the past: new findings and a review. *Mem. I Oswaldo Cruz* 98, 103–118.
- Goncalves, M.L.C., da Silva, V.L., de Andrade, C.M., Reinhard, K., da Rocha, G.C., Le Bailly, M., Bouchet, F., Ferreira, L.F., Araujo, A., 2004. Amoebiasis distribution in the past: first steps using an immunoassay technique. *Trans. R. Soc. Trop. Med. H* 98 (2), 88–91.
- Gonzalez, A., Clemente, J.C., Shade, A., Metcalf, J.L., Song, S.J., Prithiviraj, B., Palmer, B.E., Knight, R., 2011. Our microbial selves: what ecology can teach us. *Embo. Rep.* 12 (8), 775–784.
- Green, R.E., Krause, J., Briggs, A.W., Maricic, T., Stenzel, U., Kircher, M., Patterson, N., Li, H., Zhai, W., Fritz, M.H., Hansen, N.F., Durand, E.Y., Malaspina, A.S., Jensen, J.D., Marques-Bonet, T., Alkan, C., Prufer, K., Meyer, M., Burbano, H.A., Good, J.M., Schultz, R., Aximu-Petri, A., Butthof, A., Hober, B., Hoffner, B., Siegemund, M., Weihmann, A., Nusbaum, C., Lander, E.S., Russ, C., Novod, N., Affourtit, J., Egholm, M., Verna, C., Rudan, P., Brajkovic, D., Kucan, Z., Gusic, I., Doronichev, V.B., Golovanova, L.V., Lalueza-Fox, C., de la Rasilla, M., Fortea, J., Rosas, A., Schmitz, R.W., Johnson, P.L., Eichler, E.E., Falush, D., Birney, E., Mullikin, J.C., Slatkin, M., Nielsen, R., Kelso, J., Lachmann, M., Reich, D., Pääbo, S., 2010. A draft sequence of the Neanderthal genome. *Science* 328 (5979), 710–722.
- Hadley, C., 2006. The infection connection. *Helicobacter pylori* is more than just the cause of gastric ulcers – it offers an unprecedented opportunity to study changes in human microecology and the nature of chronic disease. *Embo. Rep.* 7 (5), 470–473.
- Han, M.K., Huang, Y.J., Lipuma, J.J., Boushey, H.A., Boucher, R.C., Cookson, W.O., Curtis, J.L., Erb-Downward, J., Lynch, S.V., Sethi, S., Toews, G.B., Young, V.B., Wolfgang, M.C., Huffnagle, G.B., Martinez, F.J., 2012. Significance of the microbiome in obstructive lung disease. *Thorax* 67 (5), 456–463.
- Hansen, J.P.H., Meldgaard, J., Nordqvist, J., 1991. *The Greenland Mummies*. McGill and Queens University Press, Montreal.
- Hardy, K., Blakeney, T., Copeland, L., Kirkham, J., Wrangham, R., Collins, M., 2009. Starch granules, dental calculus and new perspectives on ancient diet. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 36 (2), 248–255.
- Hardy, K., Buckley, S., Collins, M.J., Estalrich, A., Brothwell, D., Copeland, L., Garcia-Tabernero, A., Garcia-Vargas, S., de la Rasilla, M., Lalueza-Fox, C., Huguet, R., Bastir, M., Santamaria, D., Madella, M., Wilson, J., Cortes, A.F., Rosas, A., 2012. Neanderthal medic? Evidence for food, cooking, and medicinal plants entrapped in dental calculus. *Die Naturwissenschaften* 99 (8), 617–626.
- Hayashi, H., Sakamoto, M., Benno, Y., 2002. Phylogenetic analysis of the human gut microbiota using 16S rDNA clone libraries and strictly anaerobic culture-based methods. *Microbiol. Immunol.* 46 (8), 535–548.
- Heimesaat, M.M., Boelke, S., Fischer, A., Haag, L.M., Lodenkemper, C., Kuhl, A.A., Gobel, U.B., Bereswill, S., 2012. Comprehensive postmortem analyses of intestinal microbiota changes and bacterial translocation in human flora associated mice. *PLoS One* 7 (7), e40758.
- Henry, A.G., Piperno, D.R., 2008. Using plant microfossils from dental calculus to recover human diet: a case study from Tell al-Raqa'i, Syria. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 35 (7), 1943–1950.
- Henry, A.G., Brooks, A.S., Piperno, D.R., 2011. Microfossils in calculus demonstrate consumption of plants and cooked foods in Neanderthal diets (Shanidar III, Iraq; Spy I and II, Belgium). *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108 (2), 486–491.
- Hershkovitz, I., Kelly, J., Latimer, B., Rothschild, B.M., Simpson, S., Polak, J., Rosenberg, M., 1997. Oral bacteria in Miocene *Sivapithecus*. *J. Hum. Evol.* 33 (4), 507–512.
- Herzer, S., 2001. DNA purification. In: Gerstein, A.S. (Ed.), *Molecular Biology Problem Solver: A Laboratory Guide*. Wiley, New York, pp. 167–196.
- Hidaka, S., Oishi, A., 2007. An in vitro study of the effect of some dietary components on calculus formation: regulation of calcium phosphate precipitation. *Oral Dis.* 13 (3), 296–302.
- Hidaka, S., Okamoto, Y., Tsukamoto, S., Oishi, A., 2008. The possible role of starch in oral calcification: The in vitro formation of hydroxyapatite is regulated by a combination of protein and mineral content in dietary starch flour. *Open Food Sci. J.* 2, 10–22.
- Hobson, B., 2009. *Latrinae et Foricae: Toilets in the Roman World*. Bristol Classical Press, London.
- Holden, T.G., 1991. Evidence of prehistoric diet from northern Chile – Coprolites, gut contents and flotation samples from the Tulan Quebrada. *World Archaeol.* 22 (3), 320–331.
- Hooper, L.V., Gordon, J.I., 2001. Commensal host-bacterial relationships in the gut. *Science* 292 (5519), 1115–1118.
- Hooper, L.V., Littman, D.R., Macpherson, A.J., 2012. Interactions between the microbiota and the immune system. *Science* 336 (6086), 1268–1273.
- Huerta-Sánchez, E., Xin Jin, A., Bianba, Z., Peter, B.M., Vinckenbosch, N., Liang, Y., Yi, X., He, M., Somel, M., Ni, P., Wang, B., Ou, X., Huasang, Luosang, J., Cuo, Z.X.P.,

- Li, K., Gao, G., Yin, Y., Wang, W., Zhang, X., Xu, X., Yang, H., Li, Y., Wang, J., Wang, J., Nielsen, R., 2014. Altitude adaptation in Tibetans caused by introgression of Denisovan-like DNA. *Nature* 512, 194–197.
- Human Microbiome Project Consortium, 2012. Structure, function and diversity of the healthy human microbiome. *Nature* 486 (7402), 207–214.
- Huse, S.M., Ye, Y.Z., Zhou, Y.J., Fodor, A.A., 2012. A core human microbiome as viewed through 16S rRNA sequence clusters. *PLoS One* 7 (6), e34242.
- Iniguez, A.M., Araujo, A., Ferreira, L.F., Vicente, A.C.P., 2003. Analysis of ancient DNA from coprolites: a perspective with random amplified polymorphic DNA-polymerase chain reaction approach. *Mem. I Oswaldo Cruz* 98, 63–65.
- Iniguez, A.M., Reinhard, K., Goncalves, M.L.C., Ferreira, L.F., Araujo, A., Vicente, A.C.P., 2006. SL1 RNA gene recovery from *Enterobius vermicularis* ancient DNA in pre-Columbian human coprolites. *Int. J. Parasitol.* 36 (13), 1419–1425.
- Jakobsson, H.E., Jernberg, C., Andersson, A.F., Sjolund-Karlsson, M., Jansson, J.K., Engstrand, L., 2010. Short-term antibiotic treatment has differing long-term impacts on the human throat and gut microbiome. *PLoS One* 5 (3).
- Janaway, R.C., Percival, S.L., Wilson, A.S., 2009. Decomposition of human remains. In: Percival, S.L. (Ed.), *Microbiology and Aging*. Springer, Dordrecht, pp. 313–334.
- Jans, M.M.E., 2008. Microbial bioerosion of bone – a review. In: Wisshak, M., Tapanila, L. (Eds.), *Current Developments in Bioerosion*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, pp. 97–413.
- Jenkins, D.L., Davis, L.G., Stafford, T.W., Campos, P.F., Hockett, B., Jones, G.T., Cummings, L.S., Yost, C., Connolly, T.J., Yohe, R.M., Gibbons, S.C., Raghavan, M., Rasmussen, M., Pajimans, J.L.A., Hofreiter, M., Kemp, B.M., Barta, J.L., Monroe, C., Gilbert, M.T.P., Willerslev, E., 2012. Clovis age western stemmed projectile points and human coprolites at the Paisley Caves. *Science* 337 (6091), 223–228.
- Jepsen, S., Deschner, J., Braun, A., Schwarz, F., Eberhard, J., 2011. Calculus removal and the prevention of its formation. *Periodontology* 2000 55, 167–188.
- Jernberg, C., Lofmark, S., Edlund, C., Jansson, J.K., 2010. Long-term impacts of antibiotic exposure on the human intestinal microbiota. *Microbiology* 156, 3216–3223.
- Jin, Y., Yip, H.K., 2002. Supragingival calculus: formation and control. *Critical Reviews in Oral Biology and Medicine: An Official Publication of the American Association of Oral Biologists* 13 (5), 426–441.
- Jones, D.S., Podolsky, S.H., Greene, J.A., 2012. The burden of disease and the changing task of medicine. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 366 (25), 2333–2338.
- Jones, S.J., 1972. Morphology of calculus formation on the human tooth surface. *Proc. R. Soc. Med.* 65 (10), 903–905.
- Kawano, S., Tsukamoto, T., Ohtaguro, H., Tsutsumi, H., Takahashi, T., Miura, I., Mukoyama, R., Aboshi, H., Komuro, T., 1995. Sex determination from dental calculus by polymerase chain reaction (PCR). *Nihon hoigaku zasshi = The Japanese Journal of Legal Medicine* 49 (3), 193.
- Keijsers, B.J.F., Zaura, E., Huse, S.M., van der Vossen, J.M.B.M., Schuren, F.H.J., Montijn, R.C., Ten Cate, J.M., Crielaard, W., 2008. Pyrosequencing analysis of the oral microflora of healthy adults. *J. Dent. Res.* 87 (11), 1016–1020.
- Kingston, R.E., Chen, C.A., Rose, J.K., 2003. Calcium phosphate transfection. *Curr. Protoc. Mol. Biol.* Chapter 9, Unit 9.1.
- Koenig, J.E., Spor, A., Scalfone, N., Fricker, A.D., Stombaugh, J., Knight, R., Angenent, L.T., Ley, R.E., 2011. Succession of microbial consortia in the developing infant gut microbiome. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108, 4578–4585.
- Koeth, R.A., Wang, Z.E., Levison, B.S., Buffa, J.A., Org, E., Sheehy, B.T., Britt, E.B., Fu, X.M., Wu, Y.P., Li, L., Smith, J.D., DiDonato, J.A., Chen, J., Li, H.Z., Wu, G.D., Lewis, J.D., Warrier, M., Brown, J.M., Krauss, R.M., Tang, W.H.W., Bushman, F.D., Lusis, A.J., Hazen, S.L., 2013. Intestinal microbiota metabolism of L-carnitine, a nutrient in red meat, promotes atherosclerosis. *Nat. Med.* 19 (5), 576–585.
- Koren, O., Spor, A., Felin, J., Fak, F., Stombaugh, J., Tremaroli, V., Behre, C.J., Knight, R., Fagerberg, B., Ley, R.E., Backhed, F., 2011. Human oral, gut, and plaque microbiota in patients with atherosclerosis. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108, 4592–4598.
- Krause, J., Fu, Q.M., Good, J.M., Viola, B., Shunkov, M.V., Dereviakko, A.P., Pääbo, S., 2010. The complete mitochondrial DNA genome of an unknown hominin from southern Siberia. *Nature* 464 (7290), 894–897.
- Kumar, P.S., Leys, E.J., Bryk, J.M., Martinez, F.J., Moeschberger, M.L., Griffen, A.L., 2006. Changes in periodontal health status are associated with bacterial community shifts as assessed by quantitative 16S cloning and sequencing. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* 44 (10), 3665–3673.
- LeBlanc, J.G., Milani, C., de Giori, G.S., Sesma, F., van Sinderen, D., Ventura, M., 2013. Bacteria as vitamin suppliers to their host: a gut microbiota perspective. *Curr. Opin. Biotech.* 24 (2), 160–168.
- Lederberg, J., McCray, A.T., 2001. 'Ome sweet' omics – A genealogical treasury of words. *Scientist* 15 (7), 8.
- Lee, Y.K., Mazmanian, S.K., 2010. Has the microbiota played a critical role in the evolution of the adaptive immune system? *Science* 330 (6012), 1768–1773.
- Ley, R.E., Hamady, M., Lozupone, C., Turnbaugh, P.J., Ramey, R.R., Birchler, J.S., Schlegel, M.L., Tucker, T.A., Schrenzel, M.D., Knight, R., Gordon, J.L., 2008. Evolution of mammals and their gut microbes. *Science* 320 (5883), 1647–1651.
- Lieverse, A.R., 1999. Diet and the aetiology of dental calculus. *Int. J. Osteoarchaeol.* 9 (4), 219–232.
- Linossier, A., Gajardo, M., Olavarria, J., 1996. Paleomicrobiological study in dental calculus: *Streptococcus mutans*. *Scanning Microscopy* 10 (4), 1005–1013, discussion 1014.
- Liu, B., Faller, L.L., Klitgord, N., Mazumdar, V., Ghodsi, M., Sommer, D.D., Gibbons, T.R., Treangen, T.J., Chang, Y.C., Li, S., Stine, O.C., Hasturk, H., Kasif, S., Segre, D., Pop, M., Amar, S., 2012. Deep sequencing of the oral microbiome reveals signatures of periodontal disease. *PLoS One* 7 (6), e37919.
- Lo Vecchio, A., Zacur, G.M., 2012. *Clostridium difficile* infection: an update on epidemiology, risk factors, and therapeutic options. *Curr. Opin. Gastroen.* 28 (1), 1–9.
- Long, J.C., Kittles, R.A., 2003. Human genetic diversity and the nonexistence of biological races. *Hum. Biol.* 75 (4), 449–471.
- Loreille, O., Roumat, E., Verneau, O., Bouchet, F., Hanni, C., 2001. Ancient DNA from *Ascaris*: extraction amplification and sequences from eggs collected in coprolites. *Int. J. Parasitol.* 31 (10), 1101–1106.
- Lozupone, C.A., Stombaugh, J.L., Gordon, J.L., Jansson, J.K., Knight, R., 2012. Diversity, stability and resilience of the human gut microbiota. *Nature* 489 (7415), 220–230.
- Luciani, S., Fornaciari, G., Rickards, O., Labarga, C.M., Rollo, F., 2006. Molecular characterization of a pre-Columbian mummy and in situ coprolite. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 129 (4), 620–629.
- Lustmann, J., Lewin-Epstein, J., Shteyer, A., 1976. Scanning electron microscopy of dental calculus. *Calc. Tiss. Res.* 21 (1), 47–55.
- Marcy, Y., Ouverney, C., Bik, E.M., Losekann, T., Ivanova, N., Martin, H.G., Szeto, E., Platt, D., Hugenholtz, P., Relman, D.A., Quake, S.R., 2007. Dissecting biological "dark matter" with single-cell genetic analysis of rare and uncultivated TM7 microbes from the human mouth. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 104 (29), 11889–11894.
- Marsh, P.D., 2003. Are dental diseases examples of ecological catastrophes? *Microbiology* 149, 279–294.
- Maslowski, K.M., Mackay, C.R., 2011. Diet, gut microbiota and immune responses. *Nat. Immunol.* 12 (1), 5–9.
- Mayr, E., 1963. *Animal Species and Evolution*. De Gruyter, New York.
- McFall-Ngai, M., Hadfield, M.G., Bosch, T.C.G., Carey, H.V., Domazet-Loso, T., Douglas, A.E., Dubilier, N., Eberl, G., Fukami, T., Gilbert, S.F., Hentschel, U., King, N., Kjelleberg, S., Knoll, A.H., Kremer, N., Mazmanian, S.K., Metcalf, J.L., Neelson, K., Pierce, N.E., Rawls, J.F., Reid, A., Ruby, E.G., Rumpho, M., Sanders, J.G., Tautz, D., Wernegreen, J.J., 2013. Animals in a bacterial world, a new imperative for the life sciences. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 110 (9), 3229–3236.
- Meyer, M., Kircher, M., Gansauge, M.T., Li, H., Racimo, F., Mallick, S., Schraiber, J.G., Jay, F., Prüfer, K., de Filippo, C., Sudmant, P.H., Alkan, C., Fu, Q., Do, R., Rohland, N., Tandon, A., Siebauer, M., Green, R.E., Bryc, K., Briggs, A.W., Stenzel, U., Dabney, J., Shendure, J., Kitzman, J., Hammer, M.F., Shunkov, M.V., Dereviakko, A.P., Patterson, N., Andres, A.M., Eichler, E.E., Slatkin, M., Reich, D., Kelso, J., Pääbo, S., 2012. A high-coverage genome sequence from an archaic Denisovan individual. *Science* 338 (6104), 222–226.
- Meyer, M., Fu, Q.M., Aximu-Petri, A., Glocke, I., Nickel, B., Arsuaga, J.L., Martínez, I., Gracia, A., de Castro, J.M.B., Carbonell, E., Pääbo, S., 2014. A mitochondrial genome sequence of a hominin from Sima de los Huesos. *Nature* 505 (7483), 403–406.
- Mickleburgh, H.L., Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2012. New insights into the consumption of maize and other food plants in the pre-Columbian Caribbean from starch grains trapped in human dental calculus. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 39 (7), 2468–2478.
- Middleton, W.D., Rovner, I., 1994. Extraction of opal phytoliths from herbivore dental calculus. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 21 (4), 469–473.
- Millspaugh, J.J., Washburn, B.E., 2004. Use of fecal glucocorticoid metabolite measures in conservation biology research: considerations for application and interpretation. *Gen. Comp. Endocr.* 138 (3), 189–199.
- Mitchell, P.D., 2013. The origins of human parasites: exploring the evidence for endoparasitism throughout human evolution. *Int. J. Paleopathol.* 3, 191–198.
- Mitchell, P.D., Stem, E., Tepper, Y., 2008. Dysentery in the crusader kingdom of Jerusalem: an ELISA analysis of two medieval latrines in the City of Acre (Israel). *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 35 (7), 1849–1853.
- Moeller, A.H., Degnan, P.H., Pusey, A.E., Wilson, M.L., Hahn, B.H., Ochman, H., 2012. Chimpanzees and humans harbour compositionally similar gut enterotypes. *Nat. Commun.* 3, 1179.
- Molina, D.K., DiMaio, V.J., 2012. Normal organ weights in men: part II—the brain, lungs, liver, spleen, and kidneys. *Am. J. Forensic Med. Pathol.* 33 (4), 368–372.
- Morris, J.A., Harrison, L.M., Partridge, S.M., 2006. Postmortem bacteriology: a re-evaluation. *J. Clin. Pathol.* 59 (1), 1–9.
- Mostl, E., Palme, R., 2002. Hormones as indicators of stress. *Domest. Anim. Endocrin.* 23 (1–2), 67–74.
- Nudelman, F., Pieterse, K., George, A., Bomans, P.H., Friedrich, H., Brylka, L.J., Hilbers, P.A., de With, G., Sommerdijk, N.A., 2010. The role of collagen in bone apatite formation in the presence of hydroxyapatite nucleation inhibitors. *Nat. Mat.* 9 (12), 1004–1009.
- O'Hara, A.M., Shanahan, F., 2006. The gut flora as a forgotten organ. *Embo. Rep.* 7 (7), 688–693.
- Oppenheimer, S., 2012. Out-of-Africa, the peopling of continents and islands: tracing uniparental gene trees across the map. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* 367 (1590), 770–784.
- Ott, S.J., Musfeldt, M., Ullmann, U., Hampe, J., Schreiber, S., 2004. Quantification of intestinal bacterial populations by real-time PCR with a universal primer set and minor groove binder probes: a global approach to the enteric flora. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* 42 (6), 2566–2572.
- Pace, N.R., 1997. A molecular view of microbial diversity and the biosphere. *Science* 276 (5313), 734–740.
- Pap, I., Tillier, A.-M., Arensburg, B., Weiner, S., Chech, M., 1995. First scanning electron microscope analysis of dental calculus from European Neanderthals: Subalyuk, (Middle Paleolithic, Hungary). Preliminary report. *Bull. Mém. Soc. Anthropol. Paris* 7 (1), 69–72.
- Paster, B.J., Dewhirst, F.E., 2009. Molecular microbial diagnosis. *Periodontology* 2000 51, 38–44.

- Peterson, J., Garges, S., Giovanni, M., McInnes, P., Wang, L., Schloss, J.A., Bonazzi, V., McEwen, J.E., Wetterstrand, K.A., Deal, C., Baker, C.C., Di Francesco, V., Howcroft, T.K., Karp, R.W., Lunsford, R.D., Wellington, C.R., Belachew, T., Wright, M., Giblin, C., David, H., Mills, M., Salomon, R., Mullins, C., Akolkar, B., Begg, L., Davis, C., Grandison, L., Humble, M., Khalsa, J., Little, A.R., Peavy, H., Pontzer, C., Portnoy, M., Sayre, M.H., Starke-Reed, P., Zakhari, S., Read, J., Watson, B., Guyer, M., NIH HMP Working Group, 2009. The NIH Human Microbiome Project. *Genome Res.* 19 (12), 2317–2323.
- Pihlstrom, B.L., Michalowicz, B.S., Johnson, N.W., 2005. Periodontal diseases. *Lancet* 366 (9499), 1809–1820.
- Piperno, D.R., Dillehay, T.D., 2008. Starch grains on human teeth reveal early broad crop diet in northern Peru. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 105 (50), 19622–19627.
- Poinar, H.N., Hofreiter, M., Spaulding, W.G., Martin, P.S., Stankiewicz, B.A., Bland, H., Evershed, R.P., Possnert, G., Pääbo, S., 1998. Molecular coproscopy: dung and diet of the extinct ground sloth *Nothrotheriops shastensis*. *Science* 281 (5375), 402–406.
- Poinar, H.N., Kuch, M., Sobolik, K.D., Barnes, L., Stankiewicz, A.B., Kuder, T., Spaulding, W.G., Bryant, V.M., Cooper, A., Pääbo, S., 2001. A molecular analysis of dietary diversity for three archaic Native Americans. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 38 (8), 4317–4322.
- Preus, H.R., Marvik, O.J., Selvig, K.A., Bennike, P., 2011. Ancient bacterial DNA (aDNA) in dental calculus from archaeological human remains. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 38 (8), 1827–1831.
- Prüfer, K., Racimo, F., Patterson, N., Jay, F., Sankararaman, S., Sawyer, S., Heinze, A., Renaud, G., Sudmant, P.H., de Filippo, C., Li, H., Mallick, S., Dannemann, M., Fu, Q.M., Kircher, M., Kuhlwlilm, M., Lachmann, M., Meyer, M., Ongyerth, M., Siebauer, M., Theunert, C., Tandon, A., Moorjani, P., Pickrell, J., Mullikin, J.C., Vohr, S.H., Green, R.E., Hellmann, I., Johnson, P.L.F., Blanche, H., Cann, H., Kitzman, J.O., Shendure, J., Eichler, E.E., Lein, E.S., Bakken, T.E., Golovanova, L.V., Doronichev, V.B., Shunkov, M.V., Derevianko, A.P., Viola, B., Slatkin, M., Reich, D., Kelso, J., Pääbo, S., 2014. The complete genome sequence of a Neanderthal from the Altai Mountains. *Nature* 505 (7481), 43–49.
- Qin, J.J., Li, R.Q., Raes, J., Arumugam, M., Burgdorf, K.S., Manichanh, C., Nielsen, T., Pons, N., Levenez, F., Yamada, T., Mende, D.R., Li, J.H., Xu, J.M., Li, S.C., Li, D.F., Cao, J.J., Wang, B., Liang, H.Q., Zheng, H.S., Xie, Y.L., Tap, J., Lepage, P., Bertalan, M., Batto, J.M., Hansen, T., Le Paslier, D., Linneberg, A., Nielsen, H.B., Pelletier, E., Renault, P., Sicheritz-Ponten, T., Turner, K., Zhu, H.M., Yu, C., Li, S.T., Jian, M., Zhou, Y., Li, Y.R., Zhang, X.Q., Li, S.G., Qin, N., Yang, H.M., Wang, J., Brunak, S., Dore, J., Guarnier, F., Kristiansen, K., Pedersen, O., Parkhill, J., Weissenbach, J., Bork, P., Ehrlich, S.D., Wang, J., MetaHIT Consortium, 2010. A human gut microbial gene catalogue established by metagenomic sequencing. *Nature* 464 (7285), 59–65.
- Ready, D., Bedi, R., Spratt, D.A., Mullany, P., Wilson, M., 2003. Prevalence, proportions, and identities of antibiotic-resistant bacteria in the oral microflora of healthy children. *Microb. Drug Resist.* 9 (4), 367–372.
- Reed, D.L., Smith, V.S., Hammond, S.L., Rogers, A.R., Clayton, D.H., 2004. Genetic analysis of lice supports direct contact between modern and archaic humans. *PLoS Biol.* 2 (11), 1972–1983.
- Reich, D., Green, R.E., Kircher, M., Krause, J., Patterson, N., Durand, E.Y., Viola, B., Briggs, A.W., Stenzel, U., Johnson, P.L., Maricic, T., Good, J.M., Marques-Bonet, T., Alkan, C., Fu, Q., Mallick, S., Li, H., Meyer, M., Eichler, E.E., Stoneking, M., Richards, M., Talamo, S., Shunkov, M.V., Derevianko, A.P., Hublin, J.J., Kelso, J., Slatkin, M., Pääbo, S., 2010. Genetic history of an archaic hominin group from Denisova Cave in Siberia. *Nature* 468 (7327), 1053–1060.
- Reinhard, K., Bryant, V.M., Jr., 1992. Coprolite analysis: a biological perspective on archaeology. In: Schiffer, M.B. (Ed.), *Advances in Archaeological Method and Theory*. University of Arizona Press, Tucson, pp. 245–288.
- Reinhard, K.J., Bryant, V.M., Jr., 2008. Pathoecology and the future of coprolite studies in bioarchaeology. *Pap. Nat. Resour.* 43, 205–224.
- Remijne, Q., Kuijpers, T.W., Wirawan, E., Lippens, S., Vandenaabeele, P., Vanden Berghe, T., 2011. Dying for a cause: NETosis, mechanisms behind an antimicrobial cell death modality. *Cell Death Differ.* 18 (4), 581–588.
- Reyes, A., Semenkovich, N.P., Whiteson, K., Rohwer, F., Gordon, J.L., 2012. Going viral: next-generation sequencing applied to phage populations in the human gut. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 10 (9), 607–617.
- Rhode, D., 2003. Coprolites from Hidden Cave, revisited: evidence for site occupation history, diet and sex of occupants. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 30 (7), 909–922.
- Roberts, A.P., Mullany, P., 2010. Oral biofilms: a reservoir of transferable, bacterial, antimicrobial resistance. *Expert Rev. Anti-Infect. Ther.* 8 (12), 1441–1450.
- Rollo, F., Luciani, S., Canapa, A., Marota, I., 2000. Analysis of bacterial DNA in skin and muscle of the Tyrolean iceman offers new insight into the mummification process. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 111 (2), 211–219.
- Rollo, F., Luciani, S., Marota, I., Olivieri, C., Ermini, L., 2007. Persistence and decay of the intestinal microbiota's DNA in glacier mummies from the Alps. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 34 (8), 1294–1305.
- Rose, D.J., Demeo, M.T., Keshavarzian, A., Hamaker, B.R., 2007. Influence of dietary fiber on inflammatory bowel disease and colon cancer: importance of fermentation pattern. *Nutr. Rev.* 65 (2), 51–62.
- Ruvolo, M., 1997. Molecular phylogeny of the hominoids: inferences from multiple independent DNA sequence data sets. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 14 (3), 248–265.
- Ryder, M.L., 2010. Comparison of neutrophil functions in aggressive and chronic periodontitis. *Periodontology* 2000 53, 124–137.
- Saegeman, V., Verhaegen, J., Lismont, D., Verduyck, B., De Rijdt, T., Ectors, N., 2009. Influence of postmortem time on the outcome of blood cultures among cadaveric tissue donors. *Eur. J. Clin. Microbiol.* 28 (2), 161–168.
- Sankararaman, S., Patterson, N., Li, H., Pääbo, S., Reich, D., 2012. The date of interbreeding between Neandertals and modern humans. *PLoS Genet.* 8 (10), e1002947.
- Savage, D.C., 1977. Microbial ecology of the gastrointestinal tract. *A. Rev. Microbiol.* 31, 107–133.
- Scannapieco, F.A., Bush, R.B., Paju, S., 2003. Associations between periodontal disease and risk for atherosclerosis, cardiovascular disease, and stroke. A systematic review. *Annl. Periodontol.* 8 (1), 38–53.
- Scher, J.U., Abramson, S.B., 2011. The microbiome and rheumatoid arthritis. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 7 (10), 569–578.
- Schnorr, S.L., Candela, M., Rampelli, S., Centanni, M., Consolandi, C., Basaglia, G., Turrioni, S., Biagi, E., Peano, C., Severgnini, M., Fiori, J., Gotti, R., De Bellis, G., Luiselli, D., Brigidi, P., Mabulla, A., Marlowe, F., Henry, A.G., Crittenden, A.N., 2014. Gut microbiome of the Hadza hunter-gatherers. *Nat. Commun.* 5, 3654.
- Schroeder, H.E., 1969. Formation and Inhibition of Dental Calculus. Hans Huber Publishers, Bern.
- Seo, M., Guk, S.M., Kim, J., Chai, J.Y., Bok, G.D., Park, S.S., Oh, C.S., Kim, M.J., Yi, Y.S., Shin, M.H., Kang, I.U., Shin, D.H., 2007. Paleoparasitological report on the stool from a medieval child mummy in Yangju, Korea. *J. Parasitol.* 93 (3), 589–592.
- Seo, M., Shin, D.H., Guk, S.M., Oh, C.S., Lee, E.J., Shin, M.H., Kim, M.J., Lee, S.D., Kim, Y.S., Yi, Y.S., Spiegelman, M., Chai, J.Y., 2008. *Gymnophalloides seoi* eggs from the stool of a 17th century female mummy found in Hadong, Republic of Korea. *J. Parasitol.* 94 (2), 467–472.
- Shay, K., 2002. Infectious complications of dental and periodontal diseases in the elderly population. *Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 34 (9), 1215–1223.
- Shin, D.H., Chai, J.Y., Park, E.A., Lee, W., Lee, H., Lee, J.S., Choi, Y.M., Koh, B.J., Park, J.B., Oh, C.S., Bok, G.D., Kim, W.L., Lee, E., Lee, E.J., Seo, M., 2009a. Finding ancient parasite larvae in a sample from a male living in late 17th century Korea. *J. Parasitol.* 95 (3), 768–771.
- Shin, D.H., Lim, D.S., Choi, K.J., Oh, C.S., Kim, M.J., Lee, I.S., Kim, S.B., Shin, J.E., Bok, G.D., Chai, J.Y., Seo, M., 2009b. Scanning electron microscope study of ancient parasite eggs recovered from Korean mummies of the Joseon Dynasty. *J. Parasitol.* 95 (1), 137–145.
- Singh, Y., Ahmad, J., Musarrat, J., Ehtesham, N.Z., Hasnain, S.E., 2013. Emerging importance of holobionts in evolution and in probiotics. *Gut Pathog.* 5, 12.
- Sistiaga, A., Mallol, C., Galván, B., Summons, R.E., 2014. The Neanderthal meal: a new perspective using faecal biomarkers. *PLoS One* 9 (6), e101045.
- Sobolik, K.D., Gremillion, K.J., Whitten, P.L., Watson, P.J., 1996. Sex determination of prehistoric human paleofeces. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 101 (2), 283–290.
- Soltysiak, A., 2012. Comment: Low dental caries rate in Neandertals: the result of diet or the oral flora composition? *Homo* 63 (2), 110–113.
- Sommer, M.O.A., Dantas, G., 2011. Antibiotics and the resistant microbiome. *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.* 14 (5), 556–563.
- Spor, A., Koren, O., Ley, R., 2011. Unravelling the effects of the environment and host genotype on the gut microbiome. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 9 (4), 279–290.
- Stecher, B., Maier, L., Hardt, W.D., 2013. 'Blooming' in the gut: how dysbiosis might contribute to pathogen evolution. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 11 (4), 277–284.
- Suau, A., Bonnet, R., Sutren, M., Godon, J.J., Gibson, G.R., Collins, M.D., Dore, J., 1999. Direct analysis of genes encoding 16S rRNA from complex communities reveals many novel molecular species within the human gut. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 65 (11), 4799–4807.
- Tito, R.Y., Macmil, S., Wiley, G., Najar, F., Cleeland, L., Qu, C.M., Wang, P., Romagne, F., Leonard, S., Ruiz, A.J., Reinhard, K., Roe, B.A., Lewis, C.M., 2008. Phylotyping and functional analysis of two ancient human microbiomes. *PLoS One* 3 (11), e3703.
- Tito, R.Y., Knights, D., Metcalf, J., Obregon-Tito, A.J., Cleeland, L., Najar, F., Roe, B., Reinhard, K., Sobolik, K., Belknap, S., Foster, M., Spicer, P., Knight, R., Lewis, C.M., 2012. Insights from characterizing extinct human gut microbiomes. *PLoS One* 7 (12), 1–12.
- Tremaroli, V., Backhed, F., 2012. Functional interactions between the gut microbiota and host metabolism. *Nature* 489 (7415), 242–249.
- Turner-Walker, G., 2008. Chemical and microbial degradation of bones and teeth. In: Pinhasi, R., Mays, S. (Eds.), *Advances in Human Paleopathology*. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd., Chichester, pp. 3–29.
- Turner-Walker, G., Svversen, U., 2002. Quantifying histological changes in archaeological bones using BSE-SEM image analysis. *Archaeometry* 44, 461–468.
- Ubaldi, M., Luciani, S., Marota, I., Fornaciari, G., Cano, R.J., Rollo, F., 1998. Sequence analysis of bacterial DNA in the colon of an Andean mummy. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* 107 (3), 285–295.
- Vågstrand, K.E., Birkhed, D., 2007. Cariogenic bacteria as biomarkers for sugar intake. *Nutr. Rev.* 65 (3), 111–121.
- Vandermeersch, B., Arensburg, B., Tillier, A.M., Rak, Y., Weiner, S., Spiers, M., Aspilla, E., 1994. Middle Paleolithic dental bacteria from Kebara, Israel. *Cr. Acad. Sci. li.* 319 (6), 727–731.
- Veiga, P., Juste, C., Lepercq, P., Saunier, K., Beguet, F., Gerard, P., 2005. Correlation between faecal microbial community structure and cholesterol-to-coprostanol conversion in the human gut. *Fems. Microbiol. Lett.* 242 (1), 81–86.
- Venn, O., Turner, I., Mathieson, I., de Groot, N., Bontrop, R., McVean, G., 2014. Nonhuman genetics. Strong male bias drives germline mutation in chimpanzees. *Science* 344 (6189), 1272–1275.
- Venter, J.C., Adams, M.D., Myers, E.W., Li, P.W., Mural, R.J., Sutton, G.G., Smith, H.O., Yandell, M., Evans, C.A., Holt, R.A., Gocayne, J.D., Amanatides, P., Ballew, R.M., Huseon, D.H., Wortman, J.R., Zhang, Q., Kodira, C.D., Zheng, X.Q.H., Chen, L., Skupski, M., Subramanian, G., Thomas, P.D., Zhang, J.H., Miklos, G.L.G.,

- Nelson, C., Broder, S., Clark, A.G., Nadeau, C., McKusick, V.A., Zinder, N., Levine, A.J., Roberts, R.J., Simon, M., Slayman, C., Hunkapiller, M., Bolanos, R., Delcher, A., Dew, I., Fasulo, D., Flanigan, M., Florea, L., Halpern, A., Hannenhalli, S., Kravitz, S., Levy, S., Mobarry, C., Reinert, K., Remington, K., Abu-Threideh, J., Beasley, E., Biddick, K., Bonazzi, V., Brandon, R., Cargill, M., Chandramouliswaran, I., Charlab, R., Chaturvedi, K., Deng, Z.M., Di Francesco, V., Dunn, P., Eilbeck, K., Evangelista, C., Gabrielian, A.E., Gan, W., Ge, W.M., Gong, F.C., Gu, Z.P., Guan, P., Heiman, T.J., Higgins, M.E., Ji, R.R., Ke, Z.X., Ketchum, K.A., Lai, Z.W., Lei, Y.D., Li, Z.Y., Li, J.Y., Liang, Y., Lin, X.Y., Lu, F., Merkulov, G.V., Milshina, N., Moore, H.M., Naik, A.K., Narayan, V.A., Neelam, B., Nusskern, D., Rusch, D.B., Salzberg, S., Shao, W., Shue, B.X., Sun, J.T., Wang, Z.Y., Wang, A.H., Wang, X., Wang, J., Wei, M.H., Wides, R., Xiao, C.L., Yan, C.H., Yao, A., Ye, J., Zhan, M., Zhang, W.Q., Zhang, H.Y., Zhao, Q., Zheng, L.S., Zhong, F., Zhong, W.Y., Zhu, S.P.C., Zhao, S.Y., Gilbert, D., Baumhueter, S., Spier, G., Carter, C., Cravchik, A., Woodage, T., Ali, F., An, H.J., Awe, A., Baldwin, D., Baden, H., Barnstead, M., Barrow, I., Beeson, K., Busam, D., Carver, A., Center, A., Cheng, M.L., Curry, L., Danaher, S., Davenport, L., Desilets, R., Dietz, S., Dodson, K., Doup, L., Ferreira, S., Garg, N., Gluecksmann, A., Hart, B., Haynes, J., Haynes, C., Heiner, C., Hladun, S., Hostin, D., Houck, J., Howland, T., Ibegwam, C., Johnson, J., Kalush, F., Kline, L., Koduru, S., Love, A., Mann, F., May, D., McCawley, S., McIntosh, T., McMullen, I., Moy, M., Moy, L., Murphy, B., Nelson, K., Pfannkoch, C., Pratts, E., Puri, V., Qureshi, H., Reardon, M., Rodriguez, R., Rogers, Y.H., Romblad, D., Ruhfel, B., Scott, R., Sitter, C., Smallwood, M., Stewart, E., Strong, R., Suh, E., Thomas, R., Tint, N.N., Tse, S., Vech, C., Wang, G., Wetter, J., Williams, S., Williams, M., Windsor, S., Winn-Deen, E., Wolfe, K., Zaveri, J., Zaveri, K., Abril, J.F., Guigo, R., Campbell, M.J., Sjolander, K.V., Karlak, B., Kejariwal, A., Mi, H.Y., Lazareva, B., Hatton, T., Narechania, A., Diemer, K., Muruganujan, A., Guo, N., Sato, S., Bafna, V., Istrail, S., Lippert, R., Schwartz, R., Walenz, B., Yooseph, S., Allen, D., Basu, A., Baxendale, J., Blick, L., Caminha, M., Carnes-Stine, J., Caulk, P., Chiang, Y.H., Coyne, M., Dahlke, C., Mays, A.D., Dombroski, M., Donnelly, M., Ely, D., Esparham, S., Fosler, C., Gire, H., Glanowski, S., Glasser, K., Glodek, A., Gorokhov, M., Graham, K., Gropman, B., Harris, M., Heil, J., Henderson, S., Hoover, J., Jennings, D., Jordan, C., Jordan, J., Kasha, J., Kagan, L., Kraft, C., Levitsky, A., Lewis, M., Liu, X.J., Lopez, J., Ma, D., Majoros, W., McDaniel, J., Murphy, S., Newman, M., Nguyen, T., Nguyen, N., Nodell, M., Pan, S., Peck, J., Peterson, M., Rowe, W., Sanders, R., Scott, J., Simpson, M., Smith, T., Sprague, A., Stockwell, T., Turner, R., Venter, E., Wang, M., Wen, M.Y., Wu, D., Wu, M., Xia, A., Zandieh, A., Zhu, X.H., 2001. The sequence of the human genome. *Science* 291 (5507), 1304–1351.
- Wade, W.G., 2010. New aspects and new concepts of maintaining “microbiological” health. *J. Dent.* 38 (S1), S21–S25.
- Warinner, C., Hendy, J., Speller, C., Cappellini, E., Fischer, R., Trachsel, C., Arneborg, J., Lynnerup, N., Craig, O.E., Swallow, D.M., Fotakis, A., Christensen, R.J., Olsen, J., Liebert, A., Montalva, N., Fiddyment, S., Mackie, M., Canci, A., Bouwman, A., Rühli, F., Gilbert, M.T.P., Collins, M.J., 2014a. Direct evidence of milk consumption from ancient human dental calculus. *Scientific Reports* 4, 7104. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/srep07104>.
- Warinner, C., Rodrigues, J.F., Vyas, R., Trachsel, C., Shved, N., Grossmann, J., Radini, A., Hancock, Y., Tito, R.Y., Fiddyment, S., Speller, C., Hendy, J., Charlton, S., Luder, H.U., Salazar-Garcia, D.C., Eppler, E., Seiler, R., Hansen, L.H., Castruita, J.A., Barkow-Oesterreicher, S., Teoh, K.Y., Kelstrup, C.D., Olsen, J.V., Nanni, P., Kawai, T., Willerslev, E., von Mering, C., Lewis, C.M., Jr., Collins, M.J., Gilbert, M.T., Rühli, F., Cappellini, E., 2014b. Pathogens and host immunity in the ancient human oral cavity. *Nature Genet.* 46 (4), 336–344.
- Wendorf, F., Schild, R., Close, A.E., Hillman, G.C., Gautier, A., Vanneer, W., Donahue, D.J., Jull, A.J.T., Linick, T.W., 1988. New radiocarbon-dates and Late Paleolithic diet at Wadi Kubbania, Egypt. *Antiquity* 62 (235), 279–283.
- White, D.J., 1991. Processes contributing to the formation of dental calculus. *Biofouling* 4 (1–3), 209–218.
- White, D.J., 1997. Dental calculus: recent insights into occurrence, formation, prevention, removal and oral health effects of supragingival and subgingival deposits. *Eur. J. Oral Sci.* 105 (5), 508–522.
- Willing, B.P., Russell, S.L., Finlay, B.B., 2011. Shifting the balance: antibiotic effects on host-microbiota mutualism. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 9 (4), 233–243.
- Woese, C.R., Fox, G.E., 1977. Phylogenetic structure of the prokaryotic domain: the primary kingdoms. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 74 (11), 5088–5090.
- Wood, J.R., Rawlence, N.J., Rogers, G.M., Austin, J.J., Worthy, T.H., Cooper, A., 2008. Coprolite deposits reveal the diet and ecology of the extinct New Zealand megaherbivore moa (Aves, Dinornithiformes). *Quatern. Sci. Rev.* 27 (27–28), 2593–2602.
- Wu, G.D., Chen, J., Hoffmann, C., Bittinger, K., Chen, Y.Y., Keilbaugh, S.A., Bewtra, M., Knights, D., Walters, W.A., Knight, R., Sinha, R., Gilroy, E., Gupta, K., Baldassano, R., Nessel, L., Li, H.Z., Bushman, F.D., Lewis, J.D., 2011. Linking long-term dietary patterns with gut microbial enterotypes. *Science* 334 (6052), 105–108.
- Xavier, R.J., Podolsky, D.K., 2007. Unravelling the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel disease. *Nature* 448 (7152), 427–434.
- Yatsunenkov, T., Rey, F.E., Manary, M.J., Trehan, I., Dominguez-Bello, M.G., Contreras, M., Magris, M., Hidalgo, G., Baldassano, R.N., Anokhin, A.P., Heath, A.C., Warner, B., Reeder, J., Kuczynski, J., Caporaso, J.G., Lozupone, C.A., Lauber, C., Clemente, J.C., Knights, D., Knight, R., Gordon, J.L., 2012. Human gut microbiome viewed across age and geography. *Nature* 486 (7402), 222–227.
- Yu, S., Geng, J., Zhou, P., Wang, J., Chen, X., Hu, J., 2008. New hydroxyapatite monolithic column for DNA extraction and its application in the purification of *Bacillus subtilis* crude lysate. *J. Chromatog. A* 1183 (1–2), 29–37.
- Zarco, M.F., Vess, T.J., Ginsburg, G.S., 2012. The oral microbiome in health and disease and the potential impact on personalized dental medicine. *Oral Dis.* 18 (2), 109–120.
- Zaremba-Niedzwiedzka, K., Andersson, S.G.E., 2013. No ancient DNA damage in Actinobacteria from the Neanderthal bone. *Plos One* 8 (5).
- Zhu, L.F., Wu, Q., Dai, J.Y., Zhang, S.N., Wei, F.W., 2011. Evidence of cellulose metabolism by the giant panda gut microbiome. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108 (43), 17714–17719.
- Zilber-Rosenberg, I., Rosenberg, E., 2008. Role of microorganisms in the evolution of animals and plants: the hologenome theory of evolution. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.* 32 (5), 723–735.
- Zimmer, J., Lange, B., Frick, J.S., Sauer, H., Zimmermann, K., Schwiertz, A., Rusch, K., Klosterhalfen, S., Enck, P., 2012. A vegan or vegetarian diet substantially alters the human colonic faecal microbiota. *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr.* 66 (1), 53–60.